

STATE EDUCATION SECTOR PROJECT

INSTITUTIONAL ASSESSMENT

KWARA STATE

FINAL DRAFT

Steve Packer with Eunice Oladimeji

October 2006

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----------|
| INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| Report Objectives | 1 |
| The Assessment Process | 1 |
| Underlying Assumptions | 2 |
| Some Limitations | 4 |
| The Structure of the Report | 4 |
| SUMMARY FINDINGS | 5 |
| A BASIC EDUCATION - A BRIEF SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS | 9 |
| Access to Primary and Junior Secondary School | 9 |
| Equity | 10 |
| Efficiency | 10 |
| Quality | 11 |
| B POLICIES AND PLANS - PROCESSES, PRIORITIES AND PROSPECTS | 12 |
| KWA-SEEDS | 12 |
| Education Sector Strategic Plan, 2006-2015 | 14 |
| C KWARA'S EDUCATION SYSTEM - ORGANISATIONS AND STRUCTURES | 18 |
| The Federal Context | 18 |
| The State Level | 20 |
| Local Government | 22 |
| Working for Basic Education | 22 |
| Schools | 23 |
| Local Government Education Authorities (LGEAS) | 24 |
| SUBEB | 25 |
| The Agency for Mass Education | 26 |
| Teaching Service Commission (TSC) | 27 |
| Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST) | 27 |
| Other Public Education Bodies | 29 |
| The Private Sector and Civil Society | 30 |
| Structural Issues | 30 |
| Supervision, Monitoring and Inspection | 31 |
| D FINANCING AND FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT | 32 |
| Financing Education | 33 |
| Recurrent and Capital Budgets and Expenditures | 33 |
| Financing UBE | 34 |
| Options for Increasing Levels of Financing | 35 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Budgeting | 36 |
| Financial Management | 38 |
| Some Specific Issues | 39 |
| E HUMAN RESOURCES - PROFILES, NEEDS AND MOTIVATION | 40 |
| Skills profiles | 40 |
| Teachers | 40 |
| MOEST, SUBEB and LGEAS | 41 |
| Recruitment | 42 |
| Professional development | 43 |
| Promotion and transfer | 43 |
| Motivation – Incentives and Good Discipline | 44 |
| ESSP - A Vehicle for Change | 45 |
| F THE USE OF TECHNOLOGY | 47 |
| Technology within schools | 47 |
| Technology to enhance school improvement | 48 |
| Maximising better the use of data for better education | 48 |
| Technologies for making organisations function more effectively | 49 |
| G CHANGE MANAGEMENT | 50 |
| H THE STATE EDUCATION PROJECT | 53 |
| Some Options | 53 |
| CONCLUSION | 56 |

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks are due primarily to those in the State of Kwara who gave of their time, their knowledge and their insights. Particular appreciation is extended to the members of the ESSP Project Preparation Committee and to those in schools who found time to talk to the team during the school vacation. Back up from the British Council CUBE team ensured that we were more efficient than would otherwise have been the case

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|-----------|--|
| CUBE | Capacity for Universal Basic Education |
| DFID | Department for International Development |
| ECCD | Early Childhood Care and Development |
| EDP | Education Development Plan |
| EMIS | Education Management Information System |
| ESOP | Education Sector Operational Plan |
| ESSP | Education Sector Strategic Plan |
| FAAC | Federation Account Allocation Committee |
| GER | Gross Enrolment Ratio |
| HIV/AIDS | Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome |
| JCCE | Joint Consultative Committee on Education |
| JETS | Junior Engineers, Technicians and Scientists |
| KWA-SEEDS | Kwara State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy |
| LGA | Local Government Authority |
| LGEA | Local Government Education Authority |
| MOEST | Ministry of Education Science and Technology |
| MTEF | Medium Term Expenditure Framework |
| NAPPS | National Association of Proprietors of Private Schools |
| NCE | National Council on Education |
| NEEDS | National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy |
| NER | Net Enrolment Ratio |
| NGO | Non Governmental Organisation |
| NUT | National Union of Teachers |
| PC | Personal Computer |
| PETS | |
| PFS | Planning Finance and Supplies |
| PPT | Project Preparation Team |
| PRS | Planning, Research and Statistics |
| PTA | Parent Teacher Association |
| SESP | State Education Sector Project |
| SUBEB | State Universal Basic Education Board |
| TORS | Terms of Reference |
| UBE | Universal Basic Education |
| UBEC | Universal Basic Education Council |

TABLES

| | |
|----------------|---|
| Table 1 | The educational responsibilities and functions of the Federal, State and Local Governments |
| Table 2 | Kwara State educational organisations - roles, responsibilities and legal mandates |
| Table 3 | Local Government Education Authorities - departments, staffing and functions |
| Table 4 | Structure, functions, staffing and challenges of MOEST |

LIST OF ANNEXES

| | |
|----------|--|
| Annex 1 | Terms of Reference (TORS) |
| Annex 2 | Note on Compliance with the TORS. |
| Annex 3 | Inception Report (11 August) |
| Annex 4 | Progress Report (21 August) |
| Annex 5 | Documentation for the Initiation Workshop with the PPT. |
| Annex 6 | Schedule of Meetings |
| Annex 7 | People Met |
| Annex 8 | Selected Documents List |
| Annex 9 | Organogram of the Ministry of Education Science and Technology |
| Annex 10 | Organogram of SUBEB |
| Annex 11 | Organogram of a Local Government Education Authority |
| Annex 12 | MOEST Vehicles |
| Annex 13 | Basic education data in Kwara State |
| Annex 14 | Summary of Budgets and Accounts, Kwara 2002 - 2006 |
| Annex 15 | Recurrent Expenditure as a Percentage of Total Expenditure |
| Annex 16 | Summary of Total Expenditure on Education |
| Annex 17 | Draft Proposals for SESP |

INTRODUCTION

Report Objectives

1 This report appraises capacities within Kwara State, Nigeria to develop and implement the State's draft education sector plan. It responds to Terms of Reference (TORS: **Annex 1**) provided by the World Bank and the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID). It includes initial recommendations on activities that might be a part of the proposed State Education Sector Project (SESP) that is to be funded by the World Bank and DFID¹ as well as a broader set of findings for the consideration of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST) in Ilorin, Kwara.

2 The report focuses on how the education sector works at State, Local Government - and to the extent possible - school levels. In assessing the ability of the organisations charged with defining policy and implementing programmes in the education sector in Kwara particular attention is paid to:

- The Federal and State legal frameworks which govern their work. Potential and real tensions arising from conflicting mandates are highlighted.
- The organisation, management, supervision and monitoring of education, especially primary and secondary schooling.
- The allocation, management and use of financial resources from Federal, State and other sources.
- The capacities and the motivation of people working for education.
- The current and potential use of information technology to improve performance in the education sector.

3 These issues are set within an assessment of the scale and the complexity of the challenge of UBE in Kwara and the institutional and organisational implications of the new and ambitious draft Education Sector Strategic Plan 2006-2015 (ESSP).

4 Proposals for change - whether these are supported by external technical assistance and financing or not - are conceived within existing structural frameworks. This does not mean that in the medium to longer term more radical institutional and organisational change will not be required.

5 The degree to which there has been full compliance with the TORS is assessed in **Annex 2**. A copy of the inception report submitted to the British Council CUBE team on 11 August is reproduced as **Annex 3**. An interim progress report compiled on 24 August is attached as **Annex 4**.

The Assessment Process

6 The report has been prepared by Steve Packer (Team Leader) and Eunice Oladimeji (National Consultant). Kayode Sanni (National Consultant) conducted a situational analysis of education in Kwara State while the institutional assessment team was in Ilorin. This report draws on this work. Jim Shoobridge (EMIS Adviser Capacity for

¹ As described in the Federal Republic of Nigeria State Education Sector Project Concept Note. World Bank 17 July 2006.

Universal Basic Education (CUBE) provided helpful advice on information technology. Pius Elumeze (National Consultant for the Kano Institutional Assessment) assisted the team in the first week of its work in Ilorin and Samson Iroye (Local Consultant) helped the team in unearthing data and documentation.

7 The team leader paid a four day planning visit to Nigeria at the end of July 2006; to Abuja (World Bank and the British Council CUBE team) and to Kaduna where the institutional assessment in that State was well advanced.² At a meeting organised by the World Bank on 28 July it was agreed that the assessment in Kwara should overlap with that in Kano. As a result, the team leader shuttled backwards and forwards; making two short visits to Ilorin and to Kano between 7 August and 1 September.

8 Following a planning meeting of national and local consultants on 7 August in Abuja, an initial workshop was held with the Kwara Project Preparation Team (PPT)³ on 8 August and with the Permanent Secretary (MOEST) and Directorate Heads or their representatives on 9 August. Documentation for the first of these meetings is provided at **Annex 5**. This includes a set of indicative questions used by the assessment team in its meetings in Kwara.

9 At the initiation workshop meetings were scheduled with key stakeholders for the subsequent two weeks. At the end of the field mission, the preliminary findings were discussed with some but not all of the PPT on 24 August.

10 The team appreciated greatly the willingness of many people in Kwara State to discuss their work, often at short notice. The schedule of meetings is at **Annex 6**; the list of key stakeholders who gave of their time is at **Annex 7**.

9 Key documents were collected (**Annex 8**) and their analysis forms a significant part of this report. It was unfortunate however that the only other CUBE/SESP backed studies available to the team were on infrastructure.

10 Ideally, the institutional assessment would have contributed to the process by which the Kwara Education Sector Plan (ESP) is being developed. Hopefully, it can still play its part as the operational plan (ESOP) is costed, prioritised and then translated into programme activities.

Underlying Assumptions

11 The team approached its work in Kwara with three underlying assumptions which are not explicitly set out in the TORs:

12 **First**, it believes that the key organisation in delivering UBE is the school (or the literacy class or the training centre). Unless the primary focus of institutional or organisational change is on the point of delivery of learning activities the educational

² This report has learnt from the process and the draft report from the Kaduna institutional assessment.

³ This is the technical team drawn from across MOEST and from other ministries and bodies that has responsibility for defining the education plan. There had been in an intensive externally facilitated workshop in the previous week. There is considerable pressure on the members of this team as a result of regular visits associated with the Sector Plan and SESP studies.

benefits will be limited. If the school is seen as being at the lowest level of the educational system rather than that at its heart, UBE will not be achieved.

13 **Second**, the team agrees with the important distinction made in the draft Kaduna Institutional Assessment that institutions although often equated with organisations are not one and the same thing. The focus in this Report is on organisations, discrete bodies such as MOEST and the State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB). At the same time the workings of these and other bodies cannot be understood without reference to the wider institutional environment in which they operate. This can be technical and procedural as for example in budget practice, political in terms of the weight and influence which may be exerted by way of patronage and the endorsement of particular priorities at local and State level, or religious, cultural and social with regard to people's understandings and behaviours towards education. It is not within the compass of this report to give detailed attention to these wider institutional factors but any proposals for organisational strengthening and change cannot be divorced from these considerations.

14 **Third**, the report places weight on the latest draft of the State Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) and the implications that this has for ways of working in Kwara in all of the organisations working for education in the State and across all stakeholders. There are a number of reasons for this emphasis.

- The ESSP is ambitious in setting objectives and targets (although this work is incomplete) for the next ten years. It is right to do so if UBE is to be attained but the scale of the challenges that are being addressed in terms of access, equity and quality are considerable. If these objectives are to be the real focus of State efforts, then educational outcomes will need to become the main measure of the effectiveness and performance of educational organisations and not inputs, important those these are in both their quantity and their quality.
- In addition, any attempt to improve the performance of education organisations in Kwara to deliver UBE must recognize the very considerable difficulties that the existing system has in providing quality education as the situational analysis demonstrates only too clearly. How can a State system move with some urgency from low performance to a much higher level of service provision in an expanded, quality oriented system?
- Finally, education is not an island to itself. Aside from education organisations operating within the wider institutional environment to which reference has already been made, the development of education in Kwara should be set within the development framework provided by the Kwara State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy 2005-2007(KWA-SEEDS) which states clearly that *the KWA-SEEDS thrust is to enhance access to quality education for all school-age children in the State*. Accordingly, no institutional assessment can ignore the wider development imperatives, plans and programmes of Kwara State and in particular the discipline that KWA-SEEDS is seeking to bring to setting realistic objectives and targets that lie at the heart of well conceived, broadly owned plans and strategies: Plans that are realistic in their use of financial and human resources, that are defined within agreed budget ceilings and that are implemented and monitored in a well organised and transparent manner. In essence, this is the discipline of the project cycle applied to all State development activities.

15 These assumptions and the many considerations that flow from them are likely to influence the design of SESP activities, including the size of the investment that it can make in Kwara State relative to the scale of the resources needed to achieve UBE. It will play too on the emphasis that is given to discrete, topic specific projects (e.g. procuring textbooks) as distinct from investing more strategically in strengthening organisations and building capacity across the sector (e.g. the introduction of information technology).

Some Limitations

16 A study of organisations and institutions based on a quick analysis of Kwara's complex education system is bound to have its limitations. For example, a highly procedural system with many rules and regulations and apparent checks and balances may also be characterised by numerous exceptions to these rules. Tracking the true extent of these deviations from the defined norm is impossible within two to three weeks beyond learning from anecdote and personal illustration.

17 There is a remarkable amount of data circulating within the education system in Kwara and the PPT team and others were most helpful in making this material available to the report team. Enrolment figures by school, LGEA and college data, teacher numbers and profiles, condition of schools' surveys, school inspection reports, and budget estimates, proposals and expenditures over the past four or five years were all readily accessible.

18 But data are being compiled for different reasons by different organisations and departments, at different levels within the system. And in most cases this is collected and recorded on paper. Only slowly is this being brought together and coordinated through educational management information systems (EMIS).

19 The extent to which the school level data are reliable was not within the scope of the work of the report team but cross checking aggregate data across some recent State planning documents does highlight some inconsistencies. Much of this data is for reporting purposes and not for performance analysis and thereafter for policy development and planning although recent work on the education sector plan has rectified this somewhat. This issue is analysed further at a later point in this report.

20 Clearly, the collection of data has much more meaning if it is known that it will be used to benefit performance, particularly so at the level of schools, where data goes out but is rarely analysed and its implications for greater access, equity and quality returned for school level action.

21 As noted above, the timing of this study relative to the timetable for sector planning in Kwara and the roll out of all of the baseline studies leaves something to be desired. There may well be some advantage in revisiting this report after other studies have been completed, especially when the full situational analysis is done and the public expenditure review is finalized.

The Structure of the Report

22 The report that follows is in eight main sections:

A. Basic Education in Kwara - A Summary Situational Analysis

| | |
|---|--|
| B | Policies and Plans - Processes, Priorities and Prospects |
| C | Kwara's Education System - Organisations and Structures |
| D | Financing and Financial Management |
| E | Human Resources - Profiles, Needs and Motivation |
| F | The Use of Technology |
| G | Change Management |
| H | The State Education Sector Project |

23 A Summary of Findings precedes the nine main sections of the Report.

24 Sections A and B provide some of the context within which the institutional assessment is set. Sections C to G provide the substance of the report. They should be read as a whole. As the Kaduna Institutional Analysis puts it, *all areas of capacity (resources, skills and knowledge, motivation, and the clarity of performance targets which are the organisational objectives) need to be assessed and dealt with if performance is to be raised.* In other words, attention directed solely to the management of budgets or to the training of teachers or to the provision of financial incentives will not in them themselves enhance performance and thereby improve learning opportunities and outcomes for every child in Kwara. Action is required on all fronts, and horizontally and vertically across the education sector.

25 It is encouraging to see that this approach is recognised in large measure in both KWA-SEEDS and the evolving Education Sector Plan. That this is so is also a challenge for the way in which SESP defines its role in facilitating significant long-term improvements in educational performance in Kwara State.

SUMMARY FINDINGS

Basic Education - A Brief Situational Analysis

- **In the next iteration of the draft ESSP, when more specific time bound targets are set, it will be important to ensure a) that all of the targets are derived from the most accurate data available consolidated in a central EMIS system ; b) that each target is consistent over time with every other target within each sub-sector; c) that realistic medium term objectives are set in line with medium term expenditure frameworks; and d) that careful thought is given to the sequencing of targets so, for example, expansion in the primary sub-sector is reflected in targets for JSS and SSS in subsequent years.**

Policies and Plans

- **For political, developmental and educational reasons the strongest possible relationships need to exist between the development of KWA-SEEDS and the further development of ESSP.**
- **It should be recognised that the ESSP is still only a first and incomplete draft. Good momentum and commitment has been generated. But it will be important to refine and complete work on the plan as soon as possible and attain all necessary political backing.**

- In moving ESSP forward some urgent attention is needed on how to manage the day to day oversight and coordination of the plan. This may require a multi-skilled and dedicated task force with well defined areas of authority. Ideally, this would be a multi-skilled group including people from the Planning Commission and civil society representatives.

Kwara's Education System - Organisations and Structures

- The organisation and management of education in Kwara reflects the overlaps and fragmentation that arises from Federal law which are perpetuated to some degree by State laws and edicts.
- Assuming that there is no rationalisation of State education organisations in the short-term it will be necessary nevertheless to develop machinery within existing frameworks that make it possible for ESSP to be implemented as a sector wide programme.
- The central thrust of a sector wide approach is clarity of role and function in implementing a shared programme. At present coordination and cooperation is met through some sharing of information and representation on committees and working groups. ESSP will require much more joint working on a regular basis and a real attempt to minimise an overlap of functions and to coordinate programmes. Consideration should be given to an early review of the machinery required at State level to carry ESSP forward including the possibility of establishing an ESSP Secretariat based in MOEST.
- More joined up ways of working will require – in basic education – a common philosophy and agreed ways of working at all levels of the system to improve the quality of schooling. The school needs to become the key organisation in the system. For example, a new strategy for advising, supporting and inspecting schools is needed to ensure that all schools receive such support on a regular and professional basis. The potential of a single completely new all embracing inspectorate should be investigated. If this not a practical proposition then at least all of the agencies engaged in different aspects of supervision and inspection should join together to agree common ways of working. As ESSP proposes, similar reviews are required to ensure a common approach to the provision of learning materials and the professional development of teachers.

Financing and Financial Management

- It seems probable that the increase in the level of funding that will be needed to implement ESSP will have to come primarily from Federal sources given the limited prospects of raising additional internally generated revenue in Kwara. Nevertheless all available options for increasing resources for education, especially basic education, should be explored and exploited.
- While education has to compete for scarce resources within the overall

State budget, the priority accorded to education in policy statements is not matched by the levels of allocation which education both requires and deserves. Early and accurate costing for ESSP is needed as the basis for much stronger budget negotiation including through the review of KWA-SEEDS.

- **It is impossible in a short mission to determine the degree to which there is a large degree of deviation from financial rules and procedures and due process. If the general literature on Nigeria is to be believed it is widespread. And while the mission team received anecdotal and occasionally specific evidence it is not possible to conclude that deviation from the norm is rampant. What is it is possible to say is that there is considerable room for using what scarce resources there are more efficiently.**
- **This requires a reappraisal of budget preparation and to ways in which resources are allocated and why. At present - and for some understandable reasons - resources are used primarily to ensure that departments are staffed as distinct from defining budgets that are directed to achieving particular education programme outcomes. This approach will not work if ESSP becomes the framework within which everyone in the sector will be working. If programme budgeting cannot be achieved quickly, at least a) realistic budget ceilings should be set for all education agencies right at the start of the budget process and b) budgets should be defined under ESSP programme heads and not administrative line budgets. New budget practice being introduced by KWA-SEEDS should help in this regard. This is an important issue which should be addressed in the next iteration of the Education Sector Operational Plan (ESOP)**

Human Resources

- **While there are shortages in some disciplines and skills, the main challenge in Kwara is to use deploy and use existing personnel much more effectively.**
- **This requires a combination of recruitment policies that deploy people where they are most needed, recognising the disparities in the provision of education services that exist across the State; well-co-ordinated, professional development strategies that raise individual and organisational performance linked to the achievement of real education outcomes; management practices that enable people in and close to schools to take much greater responsibility for their own educational activities; salary levels that are commensurate with the roles and responsibilities expected of teachers and others in the education service; and incentives that openly reward good performance. The proposed reviews of these topics in ESSP in 2007 will be important first steps in these regards.**

The Use of Technology

- **If technology is defined in its broadest sense then the most urgent need in Kwara is to ensure that primary classrooms and schools have their minimum basic needs met in terms of infrastructure, furniture, toilets and essential learning materials. This is rightly being proposed in ESSP.**
- **Financial and educational management information systems are a necessary component and pre-requisite for the development and the implementation of ESSP.**
- **ESSP needs its own communication strategy to ensure that it is understood and supported and as an important component of generating enhanced demand for education.**

Change Management

- **ESSP can contribute to organisational and institutional change modest though this may be in a complex yet rigid organisational structure in Kwara's education system. By the very process of its development, organisational and institutional issues will have to be confronted if the ambitious goals of ESSP are really to be drivers for change in the State.**
- **The full management and operational implications of making ESSP work have yet to be addressed. In the short term this may need a dedicated task force to make things happen relatively quickly. The task force will need clear authority and lines of accountability**
- **The SESP project and the technical assistance which is already being recruited should be both flexible and proactive in the next few months in helping to sustain ESSP momentum and get year one activities underway without delay. If this requires some seed money and/or specialist advice - national or international - this should be forthcoming.**

The State Education Sector Project

- **Budget support is not a short term option. There is a strong case for interventions in infrastructure, textbooks, management information systems and a medium-term teacher development strategy.**
- **There is an urgent need to develop ways of improving what is happening in primary schools with strong support from those bodies that are closest to them. This is consistent with this report's suggested criteria for SESP supported projects and programmes:**
 - **Real impact on access to quality basic education within two years**
 - **Total consistency with school improvement strategies under ESSP**
 - **A contribution to change management across the education system**
 - **Development within the structures of the education system**

- **Utilise low cost but cost effective strategies**

Three school improvement projects are proposed.

- 1 A state wide programme of school improvement for 500 schools (one third of the public primary schools in the State) in each of the 16 LGEAs, allied to a programme of LGEA development and capacity building.**
- 2 A quality assessment programme that introduces and then sustains regular testing for numeracy and reading in all of Kwara's primary schools, allied to building the capacity to develop the programme, implement it and use the findings to inform school improvement strategies.**
- 3 A school networking project to develop the capacities of schools to resolve some of their own individual problems through building links and undertaking joint activities within school clusters.**

A BASIC EDUCATION - A BRIEF SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS⁴

26 The brief overview that follows is selective. It focuses on UBE and therefore primary and junior secondary education. The draft situation analysis for Kwara which has been prepared separately gives broader coverage and should be read for a more sector wide view.

Access to Primary and Junior Secondary School⁵

27 The KWA-SEEDS strategy suggests that 12% of boys and 14% of girls of primary school-age were out of school in 2004 whether as dropouts or as children who have never been in school. On the other hand, it also reports that 362,000 children out of a school age population of 398,500 were enrolled in school which is a shortfall of just over 9%.⁶ The draft situational analysis on the other hand drawing on Federal data cites a net enrolment ratio (NER) figure of 80% in 2005, indicating that 20% of school age children are out of school. Using Federal total enrolment figures this would suggest that up to 100,000 children are not enrolled for primary education (although some may be in Junior Secondary School).

28 But data in the draft education sector plan quoting MOEST figures puts the enrolment figures very much higher at 567,000 in public primary schools (and a further 57,000 in private schools). While this figure might suggest a large number of under and over age children it also seems that there are significant data discrepancies.

29 Better census and EMIS data expected later this year should help to clarify the situation and hopefully also enable better gender analysis and highlight net enrolment levels at the LGA level so that inequities across the State can be pinpointed. It is imperative that in meeting UBE objectives that those children who are most

⁴ A basic data sheet for Kwara's education system is at **Annex 13**

⁵ Data reported in this section is derived from the draft situational analysis, KWA-SEEDDS and the draft Education Sector Plan.

⁶ Some MOEST officials believe the percentage of children out of school could be much higher than this.

disadvantaged should be identified and served.

30 Whatever the actual shortfall, there has been progress in the State with an increase in the level of enrolment of nearly 45% in total enrolments between 2000 and 2005 (although again the authority for this figure is not clear).⁷

31 The levels of enrolment are much lower relatively at the Junior Secondary level; a gross enrolment ratio (GER) of just over 40% in 2005 (37% for girls).

32 The first draft of the ESP fails to set specific access targets; this is work in progress, although it does set a basic completion rate of 100% by 2015. Depending on how completion is defined this is a very ambitious target.⁸

Equity

33 There is gender inequity in education in Kwara although it is less pronounced than in many Nigerian States. Federal EMIS data for 2004 suggests that girls account for 44.99% of total primary enrolment. MOEST data for 2004/5 has a figure one percentage higher than this while private schools in Kwara have almost achieved gender parity in enrolment.

34 Other types of inequity by income, geographical location, language and other social and economic factors are less easy to map but must be analysed as the basis for a true UBE policy to be implemented.

35 There are Islamic schools in Kwara for which no data are readily available and there are 50 nomadic schools catering for over 3,500 children. The social analysis that is being conducted should be instructive in all of these regards.

36 The draft plan makes reference to increasing access to basic education especially for girls and vulnerable children and proposes an as yet undefined target. When it is defined this target needs to be set within and be consistent with overall net and gross enrolment time bound objectives.

Efficiency

37 There is no totally accurate completion data but the proxy of gross enrolment at the beginning of the last grade of primary school is being used. The KWA-SEEDS document records gross completion rates of just over 70% (with girls about five percentage points lower) and much lower rates at junior secondary school of 42% (39% for girls).

38 The situational analysis highlights that drop out is noticeably high in four Local Government Areas (LGAs) where early marriage and high levels of child labour are prevalent.

⁷ It is cited in a situational analysis prepared by the Kwara Project Preparation Team (PPT).

⁸ If completion is defined as all grade six age children completing and graduating from the last year of primary in 2015, it implies that all school age children should enrol in Primary 1 in 2010 and progress without drop out for the next six years.

39 A further measure of efficiency is transition to the next level of schooling. Federal EMIS data indicates a primary to Junior Secondary transition rate of just over 50% in 2005 (and almost gender neutral) but with the proposed introduction of automatic promotion as a central plank of UBE which should start in Kwara in the school year 2006/07 this figure is expected to rise (with numerous attendant problems).

40 Beyond the completion target there are no interim targets for reducing dropout in the draft sector plan.

Quality

41 Data on learning standards and outcomes was not readily available to the assessment team. The situational analysis cites a draft study on the learning achievements of children in grades four and six which suggests that Kwara is about average in Nigeria although below average at the higher grades of primary schooling which is most pronounced in rural areas. Boys perform better than girls and those who have attended pre-primary classes also do better. And a child in a private school is also likely to perform better than his or her counterpart in a public school.

42 For those who do progress to Junior Secondary, learning outcomes are better than at primary (for a much smaller group of children) if judged by JSCE passes in core subjects (ranging from 79%-91% between 2001 and 2005). Performance then falls away quite dramatically at the Senior Secondary level in national and regional examinations.

43 Compared with some Nigerian States proxy measures of quality are not that bad. The primary pupil teacher ratio in Kwara is reported to be 34.1 in public primary schools and the pupil to core textbook ratio is 3.65 (2005). Paradoxically the situational analysis also points to a significant teacher shortage of over 12,000 teachers. These two contrasting teacher related figures need to be reconciled. There are certainly shortages in key subject areas - English, mathematics and the sciences and 28% of primary teachers do not have the minimum teaching qualification of NCE.⁹ Additionally, the distribution of qualified teachers across the State is apparently inequitable although aggregate data to this effect was not available.

44 Quality learning is also severely constrained by sub-standard infrastructure and learning environments. Some schools visited by the team were hazardous, unsafe and unhealthy. LGEAs record the condition of classrooms. From a sample seen by the team the incidence of poor classrooms in use and repairs rated as urgent or very urgent is extremely high. Aggregate data would no doubt paint a bleak picture across the State. And the development of new classrooms and new schools nowhere near matches current needs and those envisaged under ESSP.

45 Some other aspects of quality including support to and inspection of schools, assessment, training and professional development opportunities are dealt with in later sections of this report.

46 These indicators and the ambitious targets (some of which have yet to specified)

⁹ Because Nigerian schools recruit specialist subject teachers there are dramatic shortfalls in the numbers of teachers with the requisite subject qualifications in the core curriculum subjects.

to rectify them in the next ten years set out in the ESSP point to major policy challenges. How to ensure equitable access to an education of even minimally acceptable quality requires a combination of increased investment, a joined up approach to school improvement and new levels of commitment and motivation across the sector but especially within and for schools.

Summary Findings

In the next iteration of the draft ESSP, when more specific time bound targets are set, it will be important to ensure a) that all of the targets are derived from the most accurate data available consolidated in a central EMIS system ; b) that each target is consistent over time with every other target within each sub-sector; c) that realistic medium term objectives are set in line with medium term expenditure frameworks; and d) that careful thought is given to the sequencing of targets so, for example, expansion in the primary sub-sector is reflected in targets for JSS and SSS in subsequent years.

B POLICIES AND PLANS - PROCESSES, PRIORITIES AND PROSPECTS

47 Education is not an island and work that is being undertaken on the sector should be put into a wider development framework.

KWA-SEEDS

48 At the end of 2004, Kwara State Government published its SEEDS strategy - The State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy or KWA-SEEDS - which derives its authority and its basic approach from the Federal, National and Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (NEEDS).

49 In Kwara, the strategy is described as the product of a broad consultative process and according to Kwara's Planning Commission¹⁰ it is publicised and broadly understood across the State. The strategy has three pillars: human development, promoting the private sector and improving governance. In addition, weight is given to gender equality, to HIV/AIDS and commits Kwara to achieving all eight of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGS) by 2015 including Universal Primary Education (UPE) and gender parity in school enrolments.

50 Reference is made in KWA-SEEDS to an educational situation analysis (not seen by the institutional assessment team). It highlights very low retention rates in rural primary schools, high pupil teacher ratios (not borne out by the overall State average) and classroom overcrowding in urban areas, poor learning environments and weak educational management. KWA-SEEDS sets six very challenging targets for 2007 and provides headline strategy statements for their achievement:

- 100% registration (enrolment?) in primary and secondary schools
- 80% attendance and retention in secondary schools

¹⁰ The Planning Commission was constituted in 1996. Its mandate includes planning for social and economic development, manpower planning and the coordination of technical assistance. It works in cooperation through State ministries including through the provision planning and statistics officers and advice. It has a statistical unit which collates data across all the sectors.

- 100% transition from primary to junior secondary and from junior secondary to senior secondary
- An increase in levels of literacy from 40% to 70%
- More science and technology than humanities students
- Integrate English, Mathematics, Science and Social Studies in 10% of Islamiyya schools.

51 These targets now seem to have been overtaken by work undertaken for ESSP. Longer term indicative targets are now being set for enrolment and better quality. In any case the data in KWA-SEEDS does not tally in all areas with ESSP.¹¹ According to the Planning Commission much education data in the State is suspect although it broadly accepts that the data being used in the development of the current sector plan is the best that is currently available. And that it is considerably better than that collected by a World Bank supported, EFA data collection exercise in 2003 which Planning Commission statisticians say was technically flawed and gave rise to some bizarre results. This is a not uniquely educational problem. The MDG monitoring unit in the Planning Commission indicated that they are unable to report accurately on progress towards any of the MDGS.

52 KWA-SEEDS also proposes public service reforms, improved budget processes and financial management, a drive to increase levels of public expenditure and the establishment of an institutional framework for the implementation of KWA-SEEDS. Of particular relevance to education are commitments to recruit additional teachers, establish a comprehensive computerised data base for the public service including the Teacher Service Commission, improve budget practice and a fraud free public service, and the creation of a Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) with recurrent and budget ceilings for all sectors for the period 2005-2007. The Planning Commission is the secretariat to both coordinate the implementation of KWA-SEEDS and serve the KWA-SEEDS Independent Monitoring Committee (which has representatives from a variety of stakeholder groups and is charged with publicising progress reports).

53 In addition KWA-SEEDS gives backing to sector-wide approaches in development planning and practice which is now being exemplified by work on the Education Sector Strategic Plan.

54 This new State - wide approach to development planning is important context for the education sector. It provides a key part of the institutional environment within which education can and should advance. Proposed changes in the fundamental ways in which government operates will impact on a sector which has the highest number of government employees and up to 19% of the recurrent government budget in 2006.

55 The extent to which significant progress has been made in reaching KWA-SEEDS targets was not immediately clear to the institutional assessment team. There does not appear to be a common monitoring framework or format against which progress can be assessed although the Planning Commission monitoring team undertakes missions to assess plan and project related progress. An overall review of KWA-SEEDS is about to be launched.

¹¹ For example, the KWA-SEEDS has two different figures adult literacy citing 56% for 2002 but also refers to 40% when setting a 75% target for 2007. The draft Education Strategic Plan cites a figure of 61% in 2006 setting a target of adult functional literacy of 75% by 2010.

56 It also seems clear that there should be close working relationships between the Commission and sector ministries at both the strategic and practical everyday level of working. A planner is provided to MOEST but the Commission is critical of the use to which he/she is put, suggesting that their skills are not being put to best effect. Engagement of the Planning Commission with ESSP is enabled by its membership of the PPT. And the Commission undertakes survey work of progress that ministries are making in setting up management information systems, although it appears that the reports are rather “sketchy.”¹²

Summary Finding

For political, development and educational reasons the strongest possible relationships need to exist between the development of KWA-SEEDS and the further development of ESSP.

The Kwara Education Sector Strategic Plan, 2006-2015

57 Over the past four years a number of educational policy and planning documents have been prepared. These include:

- The Education Summit November 2003 which resulted in the Blueprint of the Education Summit (which fed into the preparation of KWA-SEEDS)
- The State Ministry of Education of Education, Science and Technology Reviewed Draft Action Plan: Education for All (EFA) 2005-2015.
- The Educational Sectoral Plan 2005-2007 (A Document Submitted for World Bank Assistance).
- The Kwara State Education Sector Plan 2005-2015, September 2005
- The Education Sector Policy Framework, 2006
- The Draft Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) 2006-2015
- The Draft Education Sector Strategic Operational Plan (ESOP) 2006-2009, July 2006.

58 The preparation of these documents has required much policy debate and planning activity. At best, this represents the evolution and refinement of realistic plans and programmes. At worst, it suggests a duplication of effort with constantly changing timeframes. It may also suggest that this is largely internal education sector planning without wider government support. For example, The Educational Sectoral Plan 2005-2007 identifies eight priority areas and identifies an estimated funding gap of N28.5billion. The 2006 ESP has seven areas of priority which overlap but are not the same as in the preceding year. And they have yet to be costed. There are also data differences across the different documents.

59 It is to be hoped that the intensive work undertaken in 2006 is a real basis for a medium to long term programme of work with clear objectives, underpinned by sound financing with well managed and coordinated programmes at all levels of the education system. The most recent planning documents do represent an effort to be comprehensive and promote a sector wide approach.

¹² A UNDP supported Kwara State study on strengthening management information systems is due out shortly.

60 **Seven areas of priority** have been identified in the first incomplete draft of the ESSP, four of which are devoted to improving educational outcomes in:

- Basic education: Early Childhood Care and Development Education (ECCDE), Primary and Junior Secondary (Free, good quality universal basic education to all young people irrespective of faith, social and physical challenge).
- Senior Secondary and Technical Vocational (Expand and make secondary education more efficient and appropriate to higher educational and employment needs and to self-reliance).
- Adult and Non-Formal Education (Provide opportunities to those who have missed out on formal education to acquire literacy, numeracy and life skills)
- Higher and Technical Education (Develop a high-quality efficient education system that meets personal, state and national development requirements)

61 The remaining three priority areas are to do with better planning, budgeting and monitoring performance in order to achieve the State's educational objectives. These are:

- Policy, planning and management (Improve capacity and performance and ensure efficient service delivery at all levels of the education system).
- Financial planning (Ensure adequate sustainable education funds that are managed efficiently and transparently).
- Monitoring and evaluation (Establish an effective monitoring and evaluation system by which MOEST performance may be assessed on an annual basis thereby ensuring strict compliance with policy objectives).

62 There are organisational and institutional implications in each of these seven areas. In part these arise from the fact that the plan is ambitious and rightly so given the current state of education in Kwara.

63 Although the work of setting specific targets is incomplete some indicators have been established (as noted above), for example, 100% primary gross enrolment (GER) by 2010, 80% attendance and retention rates in secondary education by 2012 and HIV/AIDS prevalence rates reduced from 2.7% to 1% by 2008.

64 This focus on outputs and outcomes is welcome but it is an approach that requires careful attention to sequencing. For example, the immediate implementation of automatic promotion to Junior Secondary Schools in September 2006 has implications for the readiness and the capacity of Junior Secondary Schools to cater for pupils of all levels of ability. Similarly an expansion of primary education to cater for all children will put further pressures on the system if the estimate of up to 20 percent of primary school age children out of school is broadly correct.

65 Over the ten year period of the plan pressures will build up on the upper levels of the secondary system as the primary and junior secondary sub-sectors expand. This will require additional system wide investment. In all of these contexts current levels of investment in infrastructure, teachers and learning materials will be totally inadequate in meeting ambitious State objectives.

66 This being so it is encouraging that the first but incomplete draft of the Strategic

Operational Plan (ESOP) recognises the need for a significant change agenda with a system wide approach to improving education. A three year indicative programme of work has been mapped out from September 2006 to September 2009. In the first of these three years the draft plan lists numerous activities for Senior Management and for the Departments of Planning, Research and Statistics and the Department of Personnel, Finance and Supply to operate through 14 working groups. For example, it is proposed that there should be:

- Agreement on a sector-wide management and consultation structure (September 2006) that will *revise MOEST structures to facilitate SWAP modalities*, reconstituting PRS as the Department of Policy, Planning and Management Development and PFS as the Department of Personnel and Financial Planning
- Commencement of the development of EMIS and the strengthening of staff capacity (September 2006).
- Develop MOEST monitoring and evaluation guidelines, instruments and guidelines (July 2007).
- Introduce unit costing across all MOEST departments and activities (July 2007)
- Consolidation of all existing legislation governing teachers, pupils, parents and local communities into a single document - The Professional Education Framework (March 2007).
- Prepare detailed baseline study on access, enrolment, attendance and retention for all children and schools (February 2007).
- Develop an operational Financial Management Information System (FMIS) to include a Public Expenditure Tracking System (PETS - all by September 2007).
- Agreement to introduce a capitation grant to all basic education establishments (June 2007).
- Finalisation of a Minimum Quality Standards Framework (January 2007).
- Introduction of a Physical Amenities Grant to each newly created School Management Committee (July 2007)
- Completion of a Teacher Development and Management study by July 2007 and agreed by September 2007.

67 These are examples from a long agenda of activities for the next 12 months designed to bring about substantial changes in the performance of the education system.

68 These are proposals that should be welcomed for their recognition of the need for improvement on many fronts but if these proposals are accepted in their entirety they will require an enormous effort on the part of the staff of MOEST and personnel across the whole system and beyond to give them effect while in nearly all cases people will be required to continue to undertake the many day to day requirements of administering and managing the existing system. The full implications of this way of working have yet to be addressed.

69 Clearly a process of costing, prioritisation and sequencing is required as the next stage in plan development. But further and wider support will be required, including:

- **Strong Political Commitment and Public Support.** It is unwise to move on a

programme of work of this complexity without very clear political support. This exists through the general level of priority accorded to education by KWA-SEEDS. But it now needs to be reinforced by gaining a central place in the next iteration of KWA-SEEDS after the forthcoming review. In this regard MOEST should play a very strong advocacy role in the review process.

The degree to which the latest proposals are understood beyond those who have been involved technically in their development is not known. Stakeholder workshops should be of some help in this regard. But when priorities have been agreed and programmes costed there would be considerable advantage in communicating widely the intentions of the plan and its operational activities across government and more broadly throughout the State. An ambitious plan needs to be backed by strong demand as well improved supply.

- **Involvement of the Entire Education System:** In addition to strong political and public support, members of the educational community in Kwara should be engaged in plan development and execution. The plan has implications for each and every teacher, literacy facilitator, school and LGA. The earlier the frontline players are involved the better.

One of the strengths of the first draft of the operational plan is some recognition that new planning frameworks, organisational structures and systemic ways of working may be needed (as the sample list provided above shows). But these changes in practice cannot be achieved by technical work alone. It will be important that they should be defined and implemented with some urgency but without undue haste. Given the complex of horizontal and vertical relationships in the education sector in Kwara (let alone Federal relationships) the implications for the changes that are proposed need to be worked through at all levels of the system. In this regard the engagement of the private sector and NGOs will be important. Legislation and the State government support the engagement of civil society in many matters including education. Engaging private school proprietors, Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) and Faith Based Organisations (FBOs) will be important in the further development and implementation of the ESP – in which they are keen to engage.

- **The Exercise of Realism Regarding the Financing Implications:** Detailed cost calculations and the baseline study of public expenditure have yet to be undertaken but there is little question that a substantial and sustained increase in the education budget will be required to meet plan objectives.

For example, if 20% of primary school age children are out of school - totalling approximately 100,000 children then the annual cost of enabling them to benefit from a full initial cycle of six years of minimum quality education (using the primary capitation grant of US\$12 cited in the draft operational plan) will be in the order of US\$ 1.2 million or N152.4 million (about one tenth of actual capital expenditure in 2005. But major improvements in infrastructure, learning materials, and the quality of teaching across the State will cost substantially more than current budgetary provision. And this for basic education alone when other parts of the system are also poorly funded.

set out in three short chapters annexed to the draft ESSP and the draft Strategic Operational Plan. A Sector Wide Management and Consultation Structure is proposed revolving around topic specific working groups and committees; sector performance indicators for equitable access, quality and efficiency, and resource mobilisation are sketched out, annual sector reviews advocated and long term and shorter term cost projections and financing strategies outlined. This work is no more than an initial framework. But it will be critical to get this machinery right - its authority and the professional competencies that inform it.

71 There is some real momentum to the work that has been done in 2006 in Kwara which needs to be sustained in the coming months. And it is in this context that an analysis of current structures and organisations can play a useful part

Summary Findings

It should be recognised that the ESSP is still only a first and incomplete draft. Good momentum and commitment has been generated. But it will be important to refine and complete work on the plan as soon as possible and attain all necessary political backing.

In moving ESSP forward some urgent attention is needed on how to manage the day to day oversight and coordination of the plan. This may require a multi-skilled and dedicated task force with well defined areas of authority. Ideally, this would be a multi-skilled group including people from the Planning Commission and civil society representatives.

C KWARA'S EDUCATION SYSTEM - ORGANISATIONS AND STRUCTURES

72 This section provides a brief overview of the ways in which public education services in Kwara State are mandated, structured and organised. It gives particular attention to those bodies and departments that work for basic education. It starts with three brief contextual sections on Federal, State and Local Government.

The Federal Context¹³

73 The 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria defines the nation's educational objectives and regulates the broad responsibilities for attaining these goals among the three tiers of government - Federal, State (36) and Local (774 Local Government Areas). Item 30 of Part II of the Second Schedule of the 1999 Constitution sets out the areas in which both Federal and State governments can act concurrently in the delivery of education services at all levels of the education sector. These areas include primary, secondary and tertiary education. Item 2 (a) of the Fourth Schedule provides a list of functions that are the responsibilities of the State, but in which Local Governments can participate at the discretion of the State Government and through legislation. These areas include the provision and maintenance of primary, adult and vocational education.

74 More recently, the UBE Act of 2004 and the Fourth Edition of the National Policy on Education (2004) stipulate that Local Government Education Authorities (LGEAs)

¹³ This text draws on generic material on this issue in the Kaduna Institutional Assessment.

shall have the responsibility for the financing and management of primary education in their areas.

75 In addition, both Federal and State authorities are empowered to establish parastatals through which some of their responsibilities can be discharged. And civil society has the right to play a role in education.

76 The Federal Ministry is responsible for national policy working in liaison with State ministries through the Joint Consultative Committee on Education (JCCE) and the National Council on Education (NCE). It determines education norms and standards and monitors achievement at the national level including through the NEC. The implementation of these policies at the State level is therefore presumed to be the responsibility of State governments. In turn the State Governments determine the level of participation of Local Governments in the delivery of education services.

77 The Federal Government also has some direct implementation roles. It controls many of the country's universities and other tertiary institutions and a small number of Federal Unity Colleges. State governments control most secondary schools and a proportion of tertiary institutions.

78 So the Constitution and Federal Law enables a wide range of stakeholders to be engaged in education but the lack of specificity regarding particular roles and responsibilities at the different tiers of government gives rise to overlaps and tensions in the execution of policies. At worst this gives rise to excessive fragmentation and disputes. This has been particularly evident in recent years in relation to where the responsibility should lie for the financing and payment of primary teacher's salaries and in the creation of State universities. These issues are well documented and debated and referred to below only where they give rise to current difficulties.¹⁴

79 **Table 1** provides a basic overview of the responsibilities, roles and supporting legislation at each level of government. In relation to UBE, this shows that there are responsibilities and roles at all three levels of government, with shared responsibilities in a number of broad functional areas - in planning, standard setting and the management and supervision of schooling.

¹⁴ See for example World Bank, 2004. *The Capacity of Nigerian Government to Deliver Basic Education Services*. Africa Region Human Development Working Paper Series Number 61. Washington. World Bank

Table 1 Educational responsibilities and functions of Federal, State and Local Governments

| Government | Responsibilities | Functions | Supporting Legislation/ Implementing Structures. |
|-------------------|---|---|---|
| Federal | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National education policy formulation. • Standard setting and quality control at all levels nationwide. • Coordination for a balanced national educational development. • Preparation and implementation of national education development plans and programmes. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Issuance of national education policy guidelines and directives. • Curriculum development and provision at all levels. • Infrastructure provision at all levels. • Instructional materials provision at all levels. • Staff recruitment, welfare and development at the tertiary level, in Federal Unity Secondary schools and Primary schools through the UBE programme. • Monitoring and schools inspection at all levels. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decree 16 of 1985. • National Council on Education. • National Policy on Education. • UBE Act, 2004. • National EFA Plan. • Federal Ministry of Education and its parastatals. |
| State | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • State Education Policy formulation at all levels in line with Federal policy. • Standard setting and quality control at primary and secondary level • Coordination within the State for a balanced educational development. • Preparation of State plans and programmes. • Management and supervision of pre-primary, primary, secondary, adult and non-formal education. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Issuance of State education policy guidelines and directives. • Infrastructure provision and maintenance at all levels. • Instructional materials provision at all levels. • Staff recruitment, welfare and professional development at all levels. (Except primary school Staff on Grades Levels 01 to 06). • Monitoring and schools inspection at all levels. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • State Education Laws. • UBE Act, 2004. • State Universal Basic Education Board Law. • State EFA Plans. • State Ministries of Education, parastatals and agencies. |
| Local | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management and supervision of pre-primary, primary, adult and non-formal education. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Infrastructure provision at primary level. • Provision of teaching and learning materials in primary schools. • Recruitment of primary school staff and teachers on Grade levels 01 to 06. • In-service training for primary school teachers. • Payment of emoluments of all categories of primary school staff. • Day-to day supervision of primary schools. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UBE Act, 2004. • State Universal Basic Education Board Law. • Local Government Education Authority Laws. • Local Government Education Authorities and District Education Authorities. |

Sources: (a) 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria.
 (b) National Policy on Education (2004 Edition).
 (c) UBE Act 2004.
 (c) State SUBEB Law 2005.

The State Level

80 In Kwara State, it is the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MOEST) which has primary responsibility for overseeing the development and provision of education services across the State. First established as a ministry of education in 1974, Science and Technology was made a new directorate in the ministry in 2004, reflecting

the State Government's determination to increase the importance of these two areas for economic development.¹⁵

81 MOEST discharges its responsibilities in conjunction with a group of parastatals and colleges some of which, such as SUBEB are the manifestation of national bodies at State level although their specific powers derive from State legislation. **Table 2** gives an overview of the major roles and responsibilities of these organisations. As at the Federal level, this shows common areas of activity, notably inspection. The work of each of these bodies is examined further later in this report.

Table 2 Kwara State: Education Organisations - Roles, Responsibilities and Legal Mandates

| Organisation | Roles | Responsibilities | Legal Instrument |
|------------------------------------|---|--|------------------|
| SUBEB | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Implementation of UBE programmes | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Employs, deploys, promotes and disciplines primary teachers on grade level 7 and above Monitors and inspects primary schools Provides textbooks and other instructional materials to schools Pays teachers salaries Through LGA funds Helps to refurbish and Construct classrooms infrastructure | Law of 2005 |
| Teaching Service Commission | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monitoring of secondary schools to ensure standards Appointment and employment of teaching and non-teaching staff for JSS, SSS and technical schools Promotion, transfer and discipline of staff Training and re-training of staff | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monitors standards in schools Disciplines teachers Appoints, promotes and transfers teaching and non-teaching staff (JSS SSS and technical schools) Grants study leave Pays all staff in SSS and MOEST education officers | Law No.4 1992 |
| Agency for Mass Education | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organising and implementing literacy programmes, rural and continuing education, adult and other non-formal education programmes for skills development Giving special attention to women's education, | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organises basic, post and functional literacy programmes, sponsored by LGAs and NGOs. | Law of 1992 |

¹⁵ The degree to which this emphasis is paying dividends is questionable at least with regard to technical colleges. Enrolment in the five technical colleges is just over 1200. It would have been lower if JSS students had not been admitted. The quality of the programmes is also in question with 14 out of 21 programmes not yet accredited.

| | | | |
|--|--|---|--------------------------------|
| Library Board | <p>basic literacy and post-literacy education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Acquiring, organising and disseminating educational materials • Providing facilities and audio visual and internet services | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides readers services • Introducing internet services | N.A. |
| Colleges of Education (Ilorin and Oro) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organising courses for the training of different categories of teachers • Promoting research • Encouraging all classes and communities to pursue a regular and liberal course of education | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organises courses for teachers in arts, humanities, technical and science subjects • Organises revenue earning sandwich courses in these areas | Edict 1984 Edict 2 of 1978, |
| College of Arabic and Islamic legal Studies | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As for Colleges of Education with additional responsibilities for various categories of teachers and for legal personnel | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organises courses for teachers in Arabic and Islamic Studies courses • Organises revenue earning sandwich courses in these areas | Law of 1993 |
| College of Education (Technical) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Similar functions to Colleges of Education but also promoting research and advancement of science, technology and learning • Improving science and technical education beyond secondary level | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organises technical, vocational and science courses • Organises revenue earning sandwich courses in these areas | Law No 4 of 1993 |

Local Government

82 The 16 Local Government Authorities in Kwara are answerable to the Ministry of Local Government. Each has its own Local Government Education Authority (LGEA) which is answerable to its LGA administratively but to SUBEB operationally in the implementation of its services to and for primary schools. Under the National Policy on Education LGEAs should pay primary teacher's salaries, pensions and gratuities, retrain teachers, and supervise the quality of education in their schools. They have responsibilities too for management boards at the school and District levels (although there is no evidence that these have been established) and provide data and other input into SUBEB plans and programmes as these relate to infrastructures, textbooks and teacher in-service training. As will be noted, below their ability to fulfil these and other roles well is constrained.

Working for Basic Education

83 The key organisation in the delivery of a basic education for children is the

school; while for adults it is a variety of agencies but from the State government it is the Agency for Mass Education. The sections that follow work outwards from schools.

Schools

85 A brief situational analysis is needed in addition to that provided earlier to highlight the plight of many schools in Kwara.

86 According to the ESSP there are 700 public ECCD/Pre-schools (plus 3003 private schools), 1428 public primary schools (330 private, 50 nomadic and an unknown number of Islamiyya schools) and 238 Junior Secondary Schools (plus 90 private schools). Many of these schools are characterised by:

- Unsafe and unhealthy school environments (based on LGEA School Condition Surveys). For example in Ilorin South, 163 classrooms are rated as in bad condition but in use. 39 classrooms are not in use at all. Fifty three instances of very high urgency for rehabilitation are recorded. Sample visits to school in rural and urban areas suggest that this data is unlikely to be unusual.
- School furniture is absent or inadequate. In Baruten LGEA nearly 16,000 items of school furniture are not in good condition while fewer than 4,000 items are classified as good. Over 850 items of teacher's furniture are needed.
- Toilet facilities are unacceptable. In Baruten 4 were said to be acceptable but 140 were needed.
- Teacher shortages were mentioned to the assessment team but aggregate data is lacking. Ostensibly, Kwara's PTR of 34.1 does not suggest a particular problem but evidence from individual schools suggests that the availability of teachers is very uneven, particularly (as noted above) in the availability of specialist teachers for core subjects in the curriculum. Recruitment of additional Volunteer Service Teachers (VST) was underway at the time of the assessment team's mission. ESSP has no teacher supply targets as yet.
- The attendance of teachers in the classroom is mentioned as a problem but attendance records are kept and clearly some head teachers see this as one of their particular responsibilities.
- Learning materials data was not available to the team but sample evidence indicated that the supply was infrequent (especially basic consumables such as exercise books and chalk).

87 This brief summary is intended to highlight the very poor learning environments in many primary (and JSS) schools. Schools have virtually no funds at their own disposal. Parent Teachers Associations provide some help but usually in kind. Schools have no school plans and although there is legal provision for school management boards they do not seem to exist.

88 As a consequence, the performance of schools is heavily dependent on the commitment of the head teacher (and his or her staff) and the degree to which they are not only experienced teachers but good managers.

89 Learning materials, refurbishment and training should come from SUBEB but regular assistance is by no means guaranteed. Schools are subject to a variety of forms of inspection from the LGEA, SUBEB, from MOEST (including visits from the Commissioner) and very occasionally from the Federal authorities. The impact of these

inspections is unclear. Reports are issued but the degree to which there is advice and support on teaching and learning (as distinct from administrative matters) appears limited.

90 This then is the environment where the design of major improvements in learning must be set; it is here that change is needed most urgently. This requires that schools should be conceived as places where everything is geared to better learning outcomes. Whole school improvement is required.

Local Government Education Authorities (LGEAS)

91 The LGEAs are charged with fulfilling important responsibilities in respect of primary education and physically they are the bodies that are closest to schools.

92 The law establishing SUBEB mandates the Board to establish LGEAS to be headed by a secretary who is appointed by SUBEB on the recommendation of the Chairman of the Local Government. There are 16 LGEA secretaries in Kwara. Their roles encompass the employment and training of staff, inspection and monitoring of schools, and the provision of instructional materials. They also undertake the recruitment promotion, transfer and appointment of non-teaching staff on Grades 1-6 on behalf of SUBEB. And they are required to provide feedback to SUBEB on the concerns of communities and schools. These functions are summarised in **Table 2**.

93 As the organogram at **Annex 11** shows LGEAs are structured like mini-ministries and appear to perform some similar functions as **Table 3** illustrates. But they try to do so with virtually no resources over and above those that are used for their own functioning (the assessment team was unable to obtain LGEA budgets). It appears that anything that they add to the effective performance of schools is largely dependent on their own supervisory skills and their ability to inform and influence SUBEB in a meaningful way. On occasion they may help a school to get a classroom block or some new books through the good offices of the Local Government Chairman.

94 The quality of the staff in LGEAs is difficult to gauge. A good number are experienced teachers which may or may not fit them for supervisory work. Some have held more senior positions in government and the rationale for their lower grading in an LGEA is not clear. One characteristic of systems like this is often that staff do not bring good new practices to schools but skills with which they are familiar from long experience. This may or may not be beneficial.

95 Rural LGEAs with more scattered schools are more constrained in their ability to support school improvement.

Table 3 Local Government Education Authorities - Departments, Staffing and Major Roles

| Department | Staffing | Major Roles |
|---|--|--|
| Personnel Management | Headed by a Grade Level (GL) 12 officer with two other senior supporting staff | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff matters (recruitment, appointment, discipline, training etc) • Staff management and welfare |
| School Services | Headed by a GL 12 Staff A total of seven staff (six senior Staff, four of whom operate from HQ. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum services • Development of lesson note modules • Evaluation of instruction in learning • In charge of special education, remedial programmes and nomadic education. |
| Planning Research and Statistics | Headed by a GL 12 Staff Three support staff | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Academic and physical planning • Building baseline data for research • Planning and research • Monitoring of policy implementation and projects |
| Finance and Supplies | Headed by a GL 12 officer with four clerks | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In charge of budget and funds into and from the LGEA • Stores and supplies |
| Internal Audit | Headed by a GL 12 Staff Has one senior staff and support staff | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides internal control and security of funds |

SUBEB

96 The primary implementation agency for delivering UBE is the State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB) and not MOEST although SUBEB is answerable to the ministry as well as to the national body UBEC. It receives and manages the Kwara States' share of the Federal Government 2% of Consolidated Revenue Fund (CRF) contribution, which is matched by a stipulated State contribution for the implementation of the UBE programme. The use to which this Fund is put is described in the Financing of Education section of this report. In addition SUBEB has its own largely recurrent budget from the State its staff emoluments and overheads.

97 The current Board was established in Kwara by law in 2005, so it is still a relatively new body (although it had previous incarnations). The law empowers SUBEB to provide free, compulsory and universal basic education for the first nine years of schooling and undertake management and supervision functions with regard to ECCE (as yet little developed),¹⁶ primary and JJS schooling. It recruits, deploys and disciplines teachers with the agreement of Local Governments (on Grade seven levels and above) and has overall responsibility for the management and professional development of schools and their teachers.

98 The law establishing SUBEB also makes provision for the appointment of District

¹⁶ The National Policy on Education states that "government shall establish pre-primary sections in existing public schools". It should employ and train staff, inspect, monitor and provide instructional materials. At present, pre-primary education is provided primarily by the private sector with 60% of 700 registered centres, mostly in urban areas. Fewer than 50% of primary schools have access to pre-primary education.

Education Committees and School Management Committees but there little evidence of progress on this front.

99 Although a matter still under discussion, SUBEB's responsibilities should extend shortly to JSS. A joint MOEST, SUBEB and TSC committee is meeting to determine their respective responsibilities as Junior Secondary Schools are "disarticulated" or separated from Senior Secondary Schools which many of them are currently a part. This is a matter that is giving rise to some tensions in the sector. In theory this transfer should go ahead now, in September 2006, along with automatic promotion of students from primary schools to JSS.

100 SUBEB has a board with a full time executive chairman and three board members (**See Annex 10**). The Secretary leads the work of the Board. There are four departments - Administration; Finance and Supply, Planning Research and Statistics and School Services, each headed by a Director - two of whom are seconded from MOEST. In total there are 143 members of staff (with Board members) at SUBEB headquarters (27% of whom are on Grade 6 or below). Nearly 16,000 staff (including teachers) are employed across the State.

The Agency for Mass Education

101 Poor accessibility to low quality primary schooling is reflected in the State's estimated adult literacy rate of 56% (KWA-SEEDS, 2004). An opportunity for a "second chance" and to gain new skills is provided by the Agency for Mass Education, established by the Mass Agency Law Number 3 in 1992 as a parastatal of MOEST. Section 8 of the law states that the agency shall work with MOEST on a consultative basis but report directly to the State Governor. In practice this no longer pertains.

102 The Agency is headed by an Executive Secretary (although the law provides for a Director General). There is a Director of Programmes and departments of Continuing and Vocational Education, Basic Literacy, Post Literacy and Women's Education. There is also a Department - as seems common practice everywhere - for Planning, Research, Statistics, Monitoring and Evaluation.

103 The Agency has personnel in each Local Government. It works primarily through approximately 500 literacy centres (different sources give different figures) for basic and post basic literacy programmes. Seven hundred and fifty basic literacy classes are active; 513 post-literacy classes. Altogether there are 22,000 male learners and nearly 20,000 female learners (nearly 42,000 in all). This is a small number relative to the number of adults without basic literacy skills.

104 In addition, there are five model vocational improvement centres catering for 304 adult students in 2005.

105 The sense conveyed by the Agency is one of marginalisation, financially and in terms of the influence which it wields relative to what it sees as the enabling powers of its mandate. There has been a decline in the number of centres since 2003 for lack of funding although sponsorship of programmes by NGOs helps somewhat.

106 There is also some tension with MOEST given the ministry's role in providing "advancement classes" under the 1996 Education Edict which is seen to conflict with the

powers granted the Mass Agency (Law No 3 of 1992 section 9 {b, d and f}).

Teaching Service Commission

107 Established by State law in 1992 (amended in 1996), the TSC is responsible for service delivery at the JSS, Senior Secondary and Technical School levels, although as noted above the TSC is about to lose its JSS functions. It is charged with the supervision and monitoring of schools to ensure standards and with recruiting, deploying, promoting, disciplining, paying and training secondary teachers.

108 The structure of the TSC parallels that of the Ministry and other parastatals. A political appointee chairs the Commission. The Secretary is the executive with oversight over three core departments: Personnel, Finance and Supply, Planning Research and Statistics, and Schools and Colleges.

109 In 2005, TSC employed 5,277 people of which 72% are in teaching posts, 2% are non-teaching staff and 3% work at headquarters. Its annual budget (for State approval) is for recurrent expenditure only.

110 There is some frustration regarding the TSC's inability to run an appropriate training programme as monies for training are held by the Office of the Head of Service in the State government. Training is budgeted but funds are not released. However TSC does operate a study leave programme for teachers - without or without pay - to attend part time programmes to enhance their skills; 68 altogether in 2005. But the number to get study leave with pay has fallen since 2000 (see section on Human Resources).

111 There is a strong sense within the organisation that it deserves even greater autonomy.

Ministry of Education Science and Technology (MOEST)

112 MOEST is at the apex of the inverted pyramid which makes up the school system. Its legal mandate has already been described. It has the responsibility to develop policy, coordinate planning and monitor standards to ensure compliance with the National Policy on Education directly and through other agencies and parastatals.

113 The structure of the Ministry is set out in **Annex 9**. This shows that the Ministry is headed by the Commissioner (the Chief Executive and political head of the ministry) who has overall responsibility for the implementation of the State's education policies in accordance with State and wider Federal directives. The Permanent Secretary heads six directorates, the names of which indicate the primary functions of the Ministry: Personnel, Finance and Supply; Planning Research and Statistics (PRS); Science and Technology; the Inspectorate; Continuing Education, Schools and Colleges; and Education Support Services. **Table 4** summarises their main functions and highlights some of the challenges which staff perceive as most pressing.

114 The Ministry is characterised by a relative large number of divisions and units that have changed little over the years. However the recent advent of SUBEB means that MOEST has lost most of its primary education implementation functions while retaining its policy and planning functions. Its relations with SUBEB and other parastatals appears to be relatively efficient in a formal sense given joint representation on various

committees.

115 But there is an overlap of functions although different departments are quick to offer special reasons for separate planning, research, and inspection functions. It seems that a standard model has been applied to the structure of all the main education organisations in a sense regardless of their core functions. As noted earlier whether MOEST can deliver on ESSP with its current structures will become clearer as the costs and the priorities are identified.

116 Given that HIV/AIDS is a significant risk in Nigeria - although prevalence rates are relatively low in Kwara at 2.8% and given too the emphasis that is given to this matter in KWA-SEEDS, the education system appears to give relatively low priority to this issue through a small unit in Education Support Services.¹⁷

Table 4 Structure, functions, staffing and challenges of MOEST

| Directorate | Key Functions | Staffing | Challenges as Perceived by Departments |
|--|---|---|--|
| Personnel Finance and Supplies Director with four divisions | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General administration and establishment • Supervision of MOEST finance, accounts and stores • Supervision of vehicles | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In charge 45% (130) of MOEST staff • 8% of staff are degree holders • 98% with lower certificates (OND,WASC, Secretary's Certificate, etc). • 15 % of staff on higher pay levels; • 53% on lower levels | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To follow guidelines, due process, internal security and audit systems • Insufficient funds, no vehicle training etc strengthening of the security system • Provision of office accommodation |
| Planning Research and Statistics Director with four divisions | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capital projects • Federal (ETF) and State Statistics but no research since 1999 • Inspection and registration of private schools and advancement centres | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headed by education specialist • All staff on high grades • 38% education specialists; 57% with background in building technology and related experience • 95% degree holders. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding, vehicles and accommodation • Insufficient qualified personnel • Lack of support staff • Inappropriate monitoring of private schools • Lack of central bases • Lack of IT |
| Science and Technology Director with three divisions and 10 sections | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build strong foundation for science and technology • Handle all ICT matters • Develop instructional materials | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headed by a non education specialist • 59% are degree holders; 41% have other relevant certificates HND, NCE, Technical etc) • 65 % on higher grade levels | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inadequate requisite staff • Lack of training equipment in science and technical schools • Low enrolment in the science/tech • Low patronage of the Education Resource |

¹⁷ HIV/AIDS is the subject of a separate background study.

| | | | Centre (ERC)/low Funding |
|--|---|---|---|
| Continuing Education Schools and College Director with 10 divisions | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Determination and approval of fees and student levies • Supervision of PTA the activities • Oversight of primary, secondary, primary, higher, special , women's and Nomadic education in the State | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headed by a non education specialist • 58% graduates (PHD, MEd, B.Ed); 42 % with other certificates • 13 % of senior staff are non specialist • 73 % of staff are on high grades | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Level of teacher on Grade II and III and SSCE in public schools • Lack of vehicles leading to inadequate supervision • Low staff morale because of new departmentalisation and politicisation of posts • Irregular capacity building programmes • Lack of data on Qu'ranic schools and education advancement programmes |
| Education Support Services Director with four divisions and six sections | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supervises conduct of external examinations • Continuous assessment in schools and conducts JSS exams • Develop, review and monitor curricula • Monitor and evaluate guidance and counselling in schools | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headed by an education specialist • 95 % are higher grade levels • All education specialists bar one. • 77 % degree holders | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of computer to process the JSSCE scores and other assessments • Lack of vehicles, office equipment etc |
| Inspectorate Directors with five divisions | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning, inspection and monitoring of schools • Preparation of school calendar • Writes briefs on inspection reports | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headed by an education specialist • 95 % on higher grade levels • 78% are education specialists; 22% are non specialist • 95 % are degree holders | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of vehicles • Inadequate funding • Shortage of qualified staff • Lack of autonomy of the directorate limiting its efficiency • Poor motivation in terms of regular staff promotion |

Source: Assessment team interviews

Other Public Education Bodies

117 Among tertiary bodies in the State, colleges of education (see **Table 2**) have an important role to play in training teachers for primary and secondary schools. The degree to which these organisations are geared to meet increased demand and improve quality is the subject of a separate background study. All of the colleges indicate a lack of good learning facilities and equipment for science and technical training, poorly stocked libraries (dependent on external assistance) and overall, insufficient funds to meet course accreditation requirements. As noted elsewhere the lack of funds has led the colleges to run revenue earning programmes beyond their core business.

118 Interestingly, the State College in Ilorin states that it has decreased its intake of

pre-service students to improve quality, at a time when under ESSP the demand for teachers should increase.

The Private Sector and Civil Society

119 The demand for private schooling is growing (now 10% of schools). There is a strong perception that the quality of education in these institutions is better than in most public schools. Those who can afford it send their children to private schools. Good regulation and a strong professional association of private schools (NAPPS)¹⁸ can make this a sensible policy option. NAPPS is registered with the Corporate Affairs Commission. But sound development in this direction requires a stronger inspection capacity within MOEST, a view expressed by the private school proprietors.

120 The assessment had little time to examine the role of civil society in education. Clearly the potential of communities, PTAs and NGOs is there to support and develop education. But this is unlikely to occur unless more power is given to schools and other educational activities at a local level. The lack of action on School Based Management Committees is a limitation in this regard.

121 The Nigerian Union of Teachers has an important role also. It is represented in a good number of MOEST activities And it is on the Board of SUBEB and TSC. It is concerned with teacher welfare and to the extent possible encourages professional development especially for women teachers. Its mandate includes a strong concern for the ethical behaviour of teachers.

Structural Issues

122 A number of issues arise from this brief study of the structure of the education system in Kwara, especially as this relates to basic education. It bears out most findings of Nigeria's education system. It is complex and characterised by similar functions being undertaken in different organisations.

123 Each agency has its own legal mandate and governance procedures. Each seeks its share of financing from a limited financial resource. And there is remarkable conformity regarding the organisational structure of MOEST, its parastatals and LGEAs although the capacity to fulfil similar responsibilities across the system is constrained.

124 There is a sense in most departments that greater autonomy is the route to better performance. This view is expressed in MOEST's own departments as well in the parastatals. This is partly because it is perceived that this facilitates greater political influence and the possibility of more dedicated funding although as the section on financing will suggest this may be illusory. On the other hand given the fragmentation of functions there may well be a case for looking for some greater coalition or at least coordination of functions especially in areas of planning and supervision across the system.

125 The terms of reference for this study stated understandably that the potential for change should be examined in the context of existing organisational arrangements. Yet, if ESSP is to take off then some more detailed assessment as to whether current

¹⁸ NAPPS has embarked on retraining and refresher courses on a termly basis for its teachers.

arrangements are fit for purpose may be needed. In particular there needs to be an assessment of whether current arrangements maximise what scarce resources there are to give real help to schools. In this regard the arrangements for the supervision, monitoring and inspection of schools - especially those in the nine year basic cycle - is deserving of particular attention.

Supervision, Monitoring and Inspection

126 Compared with many African education systems, schools are visited remarkably regularly, the more so in compact urban areas. Indeed some schools complain about the frequency of visits.¹⁹ And visits are made by a number of different bodies.

127 MOEST's Inspectorate has the legal mandate to inspect and monitor schools for the maintenance of standards at all levels of the education system but in reality focuses on secondary schools working to the extent possible with SUBEB and LGEAs on primary inspection. It undertakes scheduled and unscheduled visits and operates four types of inspection (Advisory, Subject Recognition, Routine and Monitoring Inspection).

128 It considers its 39 inspectors to be an insufficient number to fulfil its mandated role and its funding levels totally inadequate.²⁰ So school visits are therefore irregular.

129 Other MOEST departments also have monitoring functions. For example Continuing Education has the responsibility to monitor PTAs.

130 Visits to primary schools are more commonly made by LGEA staff and by SUBEB again following different categories of inspection. Much more occasionally schools may be visited by Federal Inspectors and by senior politicians.

131 Given the current state of schools in Kwara the notion of monitoring the maintenance of standards must to some degree be impossible, even illusory. Ideally there should be a significant rethink about what supervision, monitoring, advice and support really mean (terms that are often used interchangeably although they are very different). With an emphasis on quality in ESSP, the notion of what quality should mean needs restating. And preferably in an environment that encourages school improvement, school planning, greater school authority and with resources to use. Inspection and support should be about school improvement and not standard maintenance (although there clearly are basic standards for which conformity is needed e.g. teacher attendance).

132 If such an approach is considered possible in Kwara this is likely to lead to some further rethinking about how inspection and advice services should be organised. The assessment team met those who argued for a separate and independent inspectorate enabled to fulfil the inspectorate's existing mandate fully and professionally. This may be the answer. At the same time some urgent thought does need to be given to strengthening the capacity and the ability of those who work in LGEAs and zones to play

¹⁹ However there are complaints that secondary schools are visited much more irregularly

²⁰ There are between four and 10 MOEST inspectorate zonal officers with responsibility for inspection in their zones. Transport is a major problem in rural. One committed zonal officer travels as and when he can seeking lifts to schools. The balance between inspectors and Ilorin and those in the zones deserves some attention.

a much more proactive role than is currently the case.

133 The circumstances of monitoring and inspection replicate to some considerable degree the situation in other areas of work where is a real or potential overlap of function, for example in data collection and analysis, in continuing and mass education (as noted above), in training and in learning materials development. ESSP offers the potential to work these issues through.

Summary of Findings

The organisation and management of education in Kwara reflects the overlaps and fragmentation that arises from Federal law which are perpetuated to some degree by State laws and edicts.

Assuming that there is no rationalisation of State education organisations in the short-term it will be necessary nevertheless to develop machinery within existing frameworks that make it possible for ESSP to be implemented as a sector wide programme.

The central thrust of a sector wide approach is clarity of role and function in implementing a shared programme. At present coordination and cooperation is met through some sharing of information and representation on committees and working groups. ESSP will require much more joint working on a regular basis and a real attempt to minimise an overlap of functions and to coordinate programmes. Consideration should be given to an early review of the machinery required at State level to carry ESSP forward including the possibility of establishing an ESSP Secretariat based in MOEST.

More joined up ways of working will require – in basic education – a common philosophy and agreed ways of working at all levels of the system to improve the quality of schooling. The school needs to be become the key organisation in the system. For example, a new strategy for advising, supporting and inspecting schools is needed to ensure that all schools receive such support on a regular and professional basis. The potential of a single completely new all embracing inspectorate should be investigated. If this not a practical proposition then at least all of the agencies engaged in different aspects of supervision and inspection should join together to agree common ways of working. As ESSP proposes, similar reviews are required to ensure a common approach to the provision of learning materials and the professional development of teachers.

D FINANCING AND FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

134 To understand the financing of education in Kwara State and the options that may exist to fund the proposed ESSP programme of work it is necessary to examine:

- Sources and levels of financing now and in the future
- Allocations and expenditures within the State's education budget
- Budget processes
- The management of financial resources

Financing Education

135 The history of financing education and basic education in particular has a long and tortuous history in Nigeria.²¹ Currently, States rely heavily for their budgets on the Federal Account. Hence education along with other social sectors depends primarily on national revenues. And it is unlikely that this situation will change for the foreseeable future especially as the State's debt burden (external and internal) continues to be a drain on the State budget. In addition, efforts to raise additional tax revenue have yet to bear fruit. Thus in the four year period 2000-2004, the allocation from the Federal Account made up 73% of total Kwara State revenue while Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) accounted for only 14.5%. The balance was met through borrowing, grants and support funds and VAT.

Recurrent and Capital Budgets and Expenditures

136 Determining the exact levels of education expenditures is difficult (at least to do it quickly) by virtue of the existence of a relatively large number of separate educational organisations and parastatals with their own budget lines, the operation of special funds, notably the Education Tax Fund (ETF) which helps to finance educational activities in the State and other monies which pass through SUBEB and Local Governments from both Federal and State sources.²²

137 In 2005, the combined **recurrent expenditure** of what is termed "education services" in the State's financial statement was N2.49 billion, representing an under spend of N27.4 million. This sum covers MOEST, the Scholarship Board, the Agency for Mass Education, the Teaching Service Commission and the State's subvention to the State Universal Basic Education Board. So this money is spent primarily but not exclusively on schooling.

138 The 2005 figure compares with the much lower figures of N408 million in 2003 and N420 million in 2004. The KWA-SEEDS estimates for education set in 2004 put a ceiling on education sector recurrent expenditure of N2.97 billion for 2005, falling to N2.13 billion in 2006 and up again to N2.35 billion in 2007.

139 **Capital expenditure** in 2005 (which includes all the parastatals and not just "education services") was just N550 million although the approved estimates were for N1.49 billion; expenditure of just over one third. This compares with capital expenditure of N150 million in 2002 (approved estimate N526 million); N149 million in 2003 (against a much reduced approved estimate of N150 million); and N382 million in 2004 (against N712 million). The KWA-SEEDS estimates/ceilings for capital expenditure were N1.58 billion in 2005 (9.75% of the overall capital budget), N1.49 billion in 2006 (8.76%) and N1.3 billion (10.29%).

140 The public expenditure review study should give a much more exact view of the financing of education but the experience of recent years suggests that:

²¹ See for example Hinchliffe, K, 2002. *Public Expenditures on Education in Nigeria: Issues, Estimates and Some Implications*. Africa Region Human Development Working Paper Series. Washington. World Bank.

²² In addition some of the data in the Kwara State Estimates is difficult to disaggregate.

- While there has been some increase in the levels of financing for education since the inception of the current government, the share of education in the overall budget remains relatively modest and there is no indication within the current Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) for KWA-SEEDS that this is going to change. Indeed MTEF shows a decline in the absolute level of capital expenditure over the three years 2005-2007 and a significant decline in recurrent expenditure from the 2005 figure. In 2005 actual recurrent expenditure on education was just over 11% of the recurrent budget and less than 7% of capital expenditures.
- The rationale for the balance between recurrent and capital expenditure is not well defined. In a system that has experienced significant neglect, building it up again requires major capital investment, at least in the early years of the ESSP. But because education is people intensive so too will an expanding system require both additional human resources and people with an extended range of new skills, especially those working in or close to schools.
- Expenditure performance against approved estimates is very uneven but the more so on the capital budget.

Financing UBE

141 Within these overall allocations how does primary education fare? It has not been possible for this assessment team to answer this question with any great degree of accuracy. What is clear is that schools themselves are not purse holders. They have no authority or ability to use funds directly. How quickly this can change is doubtful. But without greater autonomy at school level it is difficult to envisage significant improvements in basic education in Kwara.

142 So what investments there are, are routed through intermediaries of which SUBEB is now the most significant. SUBEB funds go to primary schools for teachers salaries drawn from the Federal account of Local Governments and also uses funds provided by the Federal Government UBE intervention, which are matched by the State Government for infrastructure development (70%), textbooks and other instructional materials (15%) and teacher development and research (15%). The allocations work to a formula determined at the Federal level. In addition 162 schools have benefited so far from a self-help school/community grant of N450, 000.

143 Kwara SUBEB's State budget submission for 2006 was for N1.127 billion for pre-primary (5%), primary (60%) and Junior Secondary (35%). If this sum was actually to be released it would represent an average investment per annum per pre-primary child of N800/US\$6.3, N834/US\$6.6 per primary child (if the higher MOEST enrolment figures quoted in the ESSP are used) and N2,975/US\$23.4 per JSS child (again using ESSP figures). In reality, the level of funding means that SUBEB can invest in some schools in some years and not uniformly across the sub-sector on a regular basis.

144 For example, the primary infrastructure budget in 2006 allows for the construction of 36 two classroom blocks in existing schools and a similar number for new schools plus the rehabilitation of 256 classes, this in a system with nearly 1500 schools, the majority of which require attention.

145 If the learning materials budget for 2006 is divided on a per capita basis, then N120/US\$0.95 will be spent on each pre-primary school child, N178/US\$1.4 per primary child and N446/US\$3.5.

146 Whilst these figures exclude teachers salaries (paid by SUBEB through LGAs and by the TSC for secondary teachers), SUBEB is the main means of providing all non-salary finance for the critical non-teacher inputs into primary schools. Some other monies may come direct through Local Government - depending in part on how onerous the teacher salary deduction is on their overall budgets - but if they do, they are very modest. The Education Tax Fund (ETF) under the aegis of the Directorate of Planning Research and Statistics in MOEST is another source of money notably for infrastructure, and special allocations may be made by the Governor on occasion. But for a system planning to expand and improve quality, current levels of financing are inadequate. What are some of the options?

Options for Increasing Levels of Funding

147 Given the financing contexts described above and the less than promising financing situation forecast for 2007, a combination of increased levels of Federal funding allied to an enhanced share of the State budget is required. How politically realistic this is uncertain, so additional options should be pursued as well.

148 Expanding private sector schooling is one option. The demand is clearly there. If there is good registration, regulation and monitoring the private sector can play its part and thereby notionally release resources for the public sector. But this in itself is not the answer to meeting the needs of the most disadvantaged in the State.

149 Reducing the levels of debt relief is another route for releasing funds for the social sector including education. In this regard it was not clear to the assessment team as to whether recent debt relief provision for Nigeria would benefit Kwara. KWA-SEEDS reported a debt burden US\$333 million in 2002 of which 83.5% is under the Paris Club. These debts result from borrowing between 1974 and 1983. When KWA-SEEDS was being prepared the State was having to deduct N179 million a month from the State's share of the Federation Account. An internal debt of N519 million also stood against the State Government.

150 The current expenditure summary for the 2006 estimates records nearly N3 billion for public and local debt servicing; a figure in excess of total expenditure on education in 2005.

151 Another avenue for increasing the levels of funding for education is to make much better use of the resources that are already available to the system. This is examined in the sections that follow on the budget and financial management process.

152 External funding can also play a role but to what degree initially requires the costing of and prioritisation within the ESSP. Currently, there are no well founded projections of the cost of achieving UBE in KWARA. The current draft of the ESSP has financing frameworks without figures. However, the precursor of the current draft ESSP, the Educational Development Plan (EDP) 2005-2015 does include a short section (Chapter 5) which provides a set of recurrent and capital estimates for the period 2005-2015 for all parts of the education sector. The 2004 MOEST budget was used as the baseline for future projections. Some criteria are provided (i.e. a three percent growth in enrolment - although it is not stated at which level in the system), others not.

153 No great weight can be given to these figures - a new exercise is needed - but

there is recognition that the primary sector would need to nearly double its levels of expenditure between 2005 and 2015 and that it is at the basic level of education that resources are needed most urgently.

154 It is difficult to follow the logic as to how the financing gap is calculated in the EDP but it appears to conclude that if the EDP is to be implemented, State (with Federal resources) would at best meet 74% of the financing requirement.

Summary Finding

It seems probable that the increase in the level of funding that will be needed to implement ESSP will have to come primarily from Federal sources given the limited prospects of raising addition internally generated revenue in Kwara. Nevertheless all available options for increasing resources for education, especially basic education, should be explored and exploited.

While education has to compete for scarce resources within the overall State budget, the priority accorded to education in policy statements is not matched by the levels of allocation which education both requires and deserves. Early and accurate costing for ESSP is needed as the basis for much stronger budget negotiation including through the review of KWA-SEEDS.

Budgeting

155 The development of budgets in Kwara follows well established procedures. And everyone appears to be remarkably well versed in what they require. The degree to which they are fully followed is another matter.

156 It is the annual circular which sets the budget process rolling. In Kwara, this year the Ministry of Finance issued its guidelines on 27 June for the 2007 estimates. A deadline for submissions of 11 August was set; a six week period of preparation for MOEST and for the education parastatals. This year's circular states bluntly that 2007 will be a difficult year because of *outstanding commitments and liabilities*. As a consequence of this there is a strong call to exploit revenue earning opportunities and for greater accuracy in projecting only absolutely necessary personnel costs.

157 The circular also makes clear that parastatals are expected to submit their proposals to their supervising ministries (although the degree to which happens in a rigorous way was questioned by some with whom the assessment team talked in Ilorin)

158 On capital estimates emphasis is placed on implementing KWA-SEEDS projects and in this regard clearance is required by each ministry from the State Chief Executive before submitting specific proposals. Liaison is also suggested with the State Planning Commission.

159 Once the Ministry has its proposals ready they will be examined by the Ministerial Budget Committee before further submission to the Budget Department. Thereafter MOEST and individual parastatals are required to defend their submissions at the State Council and State Assembly levels.

160 Although KWA-SEEDS has clearly influenced the process of budget

preparation with regard to setting budget ceilings and requiring a focus on KWA-SEEDS projects little else seems to have changed in the process of budget formulation. Ceilings are not specified in the circular for different departments (although these may be known separately following KWA-SEEDS) and there is no reference at all to particular government objectives and outcomes beyond the reference to KWA-SEEDS. What is clear is that next year -2007 - does not look promising for an expanded, quality driven education programme.

161 Individual departments and bodies within the education sector are well versed in the preparation of budgets which are compiled in great detail - except for schools which do not have budgets. Indeed schools at the Junior Secondary and Secondary level actually have to send part of the school fees that they receive to MOEST instead of using the funds for direct use within the school. In theory, the monies that are sent on are used for specific educational purposes of benefit to the State as whole (e.g. JETS clubs, sports activities etc). But some informants believed that that these funds are swallowed up in the general revenue account. In the 2006 estimates a sum of N65 million is set down as revenue from post-primary school fees.²³

162 For those educational departments that do prepare annual budgets, two important characteristics deserve mention. First, they are largely of an incremental nature with adjustments made to budget lines year on year, especially under the recurrent head. Thus budgeting is not driven by particular sector objectives or performance related outcomes but by adjustments to the levels of funding of particular inputs - and primarily for personnel. Changes have to be justified but the premises on which the budget is based and their relations with education outcomes are not challenged.

163 There is also evidence of what can best be described as “unreal” budgeting. This applies more to capital budgets than recurrent - although it occurs under the overheads part of the recurrent budget too. The unreality arises from the very considerable differences that often exist between initial estimates, approved estimates and the monies that are actually released. As a result the funds that are actually used may bear very limited relationship to the initial request. If this happens year on year the merits of the budgeting process need to be questioned.

164 As noted earlier this is apparent at State level which of course represents the sum of what is happening in individual departments. For example, colleges of education in Kwara do not receive their full allocation for their salaries, in one instance receiving less than half of their monthly salary bill. Another teacher training college showed the assessment team estimates for 2006 which a) proposed a recurrent budget 2.3 times last years approved estimates and 3.4 times 2004 expenditures. While there may be strong justification for the sub-components of the budget, if this process is repeated year on year it makes something of a mockery of the process albeit that it is not breaking any rules. And this seems to be a characteristic in most of the organisations and units with whom the assessment team had discussions.²⁴

²³ In a secondary school visited by the assessment team N170 out a fee of N680 is paid to MOEST

²⁴ TSC has no capital budget. It receives little or no money for training. The Education Resource Centre complains that its annual work plans are not back by funds. There is no budget line for Nomadic Education.

165 The Agency for Mass Education has proposed a recurrent overhead estimate for 2006 of N7.8 million which is almost identical to the approved estimate in 2005 but actual expenditures since 2002 have been N615,000 in 2002, N1.3 million in 2003, N1.38million in 2004 and expenditure in 2005 (to the end of July) of N949,000.

166 The 16 LGEAs prepare budgets which are submitted and have to be defended at SUBEB (but not it appears within their own local governments). Their monthly running costs ranging between N70, 000 and N400, 000 a month depending on the number and disposition of their schools and their pupil and teacher populations. There is some evidence that LGEAs provide head teachers with small running cost allowances of N250-N500 a month. It is unclear what this could buy. LGEAs have very few resources indeed for non salary investments in schools except through their inspection and monitoring work.

167 The consequence of what might be termed “unreal” budgets is that those that can (such as colleges of education) raise internal revenues - possibly to the detriment of their core business - and where this not an option then other channels are pursued including through political connections and influence. At worst the budget becomes something of an irrelevance especially when it is known with some certainty that releases will not match approved estimates.

Financial Management

168 As a recent World Bank study makes clear, *Very good mechanisms to control expenditure at all levels of government already exist in the education sector.there are established procedures for the release and the use of money, for the keeping of books and reporting of expenditures. Numerous rules aimed at ensuring that allocated funds reach their intended destination, that no irregularities occur, and that no overspending takes place are on the books. To ensure that these procedures and rules are adhered to, there are internal statutory audit units in each organisation at all levels ...and in all of the States the law requires an annual external audit.*²⁵

169 This statement is certainly borne out in the assessment team’s experience. The Ministry of Finance has very precise requirements for the submission of vouchers for the approval and release of funds and for monthly expenditure returns in order to monitor the use of funds.²⁶ However, it is not entirely clear that this then results in questions or advice regarding the progress that is being made.

170 There is also evidence of increased levels of efficiency in the manner in which annual financial statements are prepared and issued at the State level.

171 One consequence of this highly centralised and labour intensive way of working is that authority for quite small financial releases is taken at very high levels within the State. We learned for example that the release of funds for capital projects in

²⁵ World Bank, 2004. *The Capacity of Nigerian Government to Deliver Basic Education Services*. Africa Region Human Development Working Paper Series Number 61. Washington. World Bank.

²⁶ Monthly returns from MOEST show recurrent revenues (including for tertiary institutions), recurrent expenditures and capital expenditures, along with the progressive total for the previous month, total expenditure to date and the outstanding balance.

Kwara requires the authority of the Governor's office. It could be argued that in a system that may be prone to leakage that high level clearance is a necessary mechanism to ensure probity and transparency. And the Finance Ministry is adamant that this is not a time consuming process.

172 On the other hand a system that delegates very little authority and responsibility to people who are engaged in the actual educational process is likely to limit motivation and responsibility.

Some Specific Issues

173 Brief attention is paid here to some of the financial management issues which arose in discussion with different departments.

174 All departments including LGEAs have their own **audit** departments able with the exception of LGEAs to produce recently audited accounts but it was not possible within the timeframe of the mission to assess their work in detail.

175 **Procurement** arrangements are set out under MOEST's Contract Policy and Guidelines. Awards of under N10 million have to be endorsed by a ministerial tender board chaired by the Commissioner (MOEST) and with representatives from the Ministries of Works, Finance, Justice and Lands and Housing. Above N10 million the approval of the Cabinet Tenders Board is required after due process by the Ministerial Board. The Cabinet Board recommendation has to be approved by the Governor.

176 Before these Board processes, all projects identified for action require the approval of the Governor, and tender documents require a certificate from the State's Price Intelligence Unit prior to public advertisement. The opening, processing and selection of successful contractors is the responsibility of the Ministerial Board. There was no way in which the assessment team could assess this process.

177 In SUBEB's case, UBEC guidelines are followed and a due process committee operates. It advertises locally and nationally for its construction projects.

178 Anecdotal information (not related to SUBEB) suggests that due process is not always followed (see also the three State infrastructure report). The assessment team also saw some evidence of unfinished construction projects most dramatically in the shape of a very large half-completed auditorium at the State Polytechnic.

179 If schools are to be visited and supported **vehicles** are needed, especially in rural areas. The only spot check which the assessment team was able to make was in MOEST which has 16 vehicles, four of which are out of service. Three are for the dedicated use of the Commissioner, the Permanent Secretary and the Director (PFS). The rest are assigned to the MOEST pool. Five of the vehicles have been bought in the last two years (funding source unknown) while the remaining vehicles are between 14 and 24 years old. For this fleet MOEST employs 12 drivers.

180 While pool use is understandable, some departments, notably the inspectorate find this a constraint. This was an issue which surfaced strongly at the inception meeting of the institutional assessment mission and in discussions too with the Department for Education Support Services.

Summary Findings

It is impossible in a short mission to determine the degree to which there is a large degree of deviation from financial rules and procedures and due process. If the general literature on Nigeria is to be believed it is widespread. And while the mission team received anecdotal and occasionally specific evidence it is not possible to conclude that deviation from the norm is rampant. What is it is possible to say is that there is considerable room for using what scarce resources there are more efficiently.

This requires a reappraisal of budget preparation and to ways in which resources are allocated and why. At present - and for some understandable reasons - resources are used primarily to ensure that departments are staffed as distinct from defining budgets that are directed to achieving particular education programme outcomes. This approach will not work if ESSP becomes the framework within which everyone in the sector will be working. If programme budgeting cannot be achieved quickly, at least a) realistic budget ceilings should be set for all education agencies right at the start of the budget process and b) budgets should be defined under ESSP programme heads and not administrative line budgets. New budget practice being introduced by KWA-SEEDS should help in this regard. This is an important issue which should be addressed in the next iteration of the Education Sector Operational Plan (ESOP)

E HUMAN RESOURCES - PROFILES, NEEDS AND MOTIVATION

181 Human development is one of the three pillars of KWA-SEEDS. Better public services including education are important contributors to human development and require a strong and highly motivated workforce in government. KWA-SEEDS makes a commitment to motivate the civil service and counter a culture of low wages, poor conditions of service, excessive bureaucracy and lack of transparency.

182 The first draft of the ESSP places considerable emphasis on capacity building and better conditions, especially as these relate to teachers.

183 With these intentions as context this section examines:

- The skills profile of those working for education
- Recruitment practice
- Professional development
- Promotion and transfer
- Other issues relating to motivation

Skills Profiles

184 Judging the skills, experience and motivation of those working for education is not easy in a short visit. There clearly are concerns in the State about the quality of teaching and the degree to which there are under qualified staff in schools. And there are certainly variations in the capacities of different departments and units in the system to fulfil their roles effectively. In part, this may reflect the overlap and duplication of similar functions across different agencies and perhaps, in particular areas of speciality a

thinning of the pool of talent that is available.

185 Many people expressed concerns about whether the right people are in the right place, especially as this relates to teachers and schools and pinpointed the lack of equity in the provision of scarce skills and experience across the State. This issue applies to LGEAs and zonal offices as well as schools.

186 Based on a limited data base, what follows is part situational analysis, part a highlighting of issues relating to skills and capacity development that deserve further study - as is proposed in the ESSP.

Teachers

187 Based on MOEST data there are 500 teachers in public ECCD/Pre-primary schools, nearly 16,500 primary school teachers of which nearly 59% of women (and a further 4,000 in private schools); 3,150 Junior School teachers and a further 3,000 in Senior Secondary Schools; altogether a minimum of 23,000 public service teachers. This represents a very significant workforce in Kwara's public service.

188 A minimum official requirement for teaching in Nigerian schools is the Nigerian Certificate of Education (NCE). In Kwara it is calculated that 72% of the total teaching force has this qualification. SUBEB data shows that just under 59% of primary teachers have NCE. A further 12.8% have a BA or BS Education degree, a Post Graduate Diploma in Education or an M.ED although the numbers in the last two categories are very small. Twelve hundred teachers have a diploma in education. But there are a further 3,400 who have none of these qualifications, representing 20% of the teaching force.

189 For a smaller primary teaching force of just over 14,000 in 2003/04, 59% of the teachers had been working for more than 10 years in primary schools while 17% were in the first five years of their teaching service. When this data is disaggregated by LGEA it is apparent that some authorities have a much higher proportion of relatively new teachers than others, for example 32% in Asa LGEA but only 4% on Patigi LGEA.

190 The disposition of this primary teaching force varies considerably too if it assessed by pupil teacher ratio which is as high 90 and as low as 19: 1 in one rural LGEA. And the proportion of women teachers in individual LGEAs also shows wide variations, notably from 20% in Edu to over 71% in urban Ilorin South.

191 The mapping of teacher supply and need proposed under the ESSP will be important to determine patterns of qualification, gender, rural or urban disposition and length of experience as a necessary underpinning for developing a teacher recruitment and deployment strategy to ensure equitable provision across the State. This work will also need to be informed by the demand for specialist subject teachers in primary schools of which there are significant shortages.

192 In secondary schools (JSS and SSS in 2005) there were 6,255 teachers of which 1,556 were from the Volunteer Teaching Service (VTS). Four thousand, six hundred and ninety nine teachers (of which 42% were women) worked in 234 schools across the State giving a PTR of 28.6 (or 22 with VTS).

193 And again patterns of teacher disposition vary considerably across the State. One hundred and twenty five teachers work in 10 schools in Edu LGEA while 673 teachers work in 21 schools in Ilorin East.

194 In terms of qualifications, nearly 62% of secondary teachers (based on TSC zonal returns for LGEAs) are graduates with a teaching qualification (42.3% women) and a further 17% are graduates without a teaching qualification (25% women). Over 17% have an NCE (41.6% women) and just under 4% (approximately 11% women) have a diploma or some other qualification.

195 The disposition of these teachers shows a high concentration of women graduates in urban areas (e.g. 328 women with teaching qualifications against 186 men in Ilorin West) but also a significant proportion of graduate teachers without an education qualification in the urban areas as well. Mapping secondary teacher patterns, by qualification, gender, subject specialisation and experience against school establishment and needs is necessary.

196 The data cited above highlight the importance A State wide strategy to ensure that there is greater equity in the deployment of staff, especially teachers, to schools and LGEAs in greatest need.

MOEST, SUBEB, and LGEAs

197 MOEST has a core staff list of 130 plus an additional 158 people in its five specialist departments. In the central ministry only 20 out of 130 are on salary grade 10 and above. Virtually all of these officers have been appointed to their post in the last three to four years. In the specialist departments most staff are of a higher grade but are supported by lower grade staff from the main ministry establishment. Virtually all of the senior staff in School Services, and Continuing Education, Schools and Colleges are graduates, as is the case in the Inspectorate. At the other end of the pay scale there are 65 employees on salary grade 6 and below fulfilling a range of secretarial, messenger and driving functions. In this group the majority have worked for MOEST for many years. Overall, at least in terms of qualifications, MOEST would appear to have a relatively well qualified and experienced staff.

198 SUBEB has 15, 9111 staff of which only 1,615 are not teachers. In its headquarters in Ilorin there are 143 staff of which 93 are on grade seven and above. In the 2006 estimates a proposal for 40 additional staff is being put forward. There was no breakdown available to the assessment team regarding the experience and qualifications of the SUBEB staff, although it was apparent that the senior staff were experienced in the education sector some of them coming directly from MOEST in the last year.

199 In the 16 LGEAs, it was only possible to get a quick insight into staff skills and capacities which are clearly varied. A good number of people come from primary schools without necessarily having much or any experience of the advisory, monitoring and local planning roles that are expected of them in LGEAs. Some are clearly political appointments, perhaps a reward for long local service. People clearly know the functions they are required to fulfil but there must be considerable doubt as to whether the LGEAs as currently staffed and resourced have the profile to provide strong school support and improvement services.

Recruitment

200 No attempt was made to study recruitment practice into the State educational organisations in Kwara. No-one suggested (unlike teachers) that there was a shortage and recent budget estimates for MOEST show a drop in overall staff numbers.

201 The recruitment of teachers is quite complex, partly because there is more than one agency involved and partly because of the politics of recruitment at the local government level.

202 Primary level teachers and other staff employed below grade 07 are entirely the responsibility of local governments while appointments at grade 7 and above (which represents most but not all teachers) are the responsibility of SUBEB. But the LGEAs recommends the number of teachers to be recruited based on their returns from individual schools. But because teachers are paid from local government budgets the Chairman of the Local Government is in a strong position to make decisions on the grade level to which a teacher is appointed. The lower the salary, the lower the charge on the budget. So, depending on the disposition of the Chairman under qualified teachers may be preferred because they cost less.

203 LGAs may also favour local teachers over those from other parts of the State. There are pluses and minuses to this. Local teachers know local contexts and language. But if specialists teachers are being sought this approach may narrow the market.

204 There is some evidence that some teachers may be recruited without any induction training, job description or rules and regulations of the service.

205 Secondary level teacher recruitment is the responsibility of the Teaching Service Commission (TSC), although the hiring of Junior Secondary School teachers will be lost to SUBEB soon. MOEST authorises TSC to recruit new teachers on the authority of the Governor. Advertisements are placed, short lists compiled and interviews conducted by a panel which includes MOEST and SUBEB representatives. There are well established procedures for recording interviews. Decisions are made and recommended to the permanent members of the TSC. Their recommendations then go to MOEST for the final approval of the Commissioner. In 2003 teachers were recruited from the ranks of teachers who had been sacked by the previous State government.

206 There is no shortage of applicants for posts in a depressed labour market, many with no educational qualifications. But as many head teachers and college of education staff bemoan these are not people with a strong vocation for education but seeking a job wherever they can find one. At the same time there is strong temptation to hire graduates in scarce subjects without education qualifications. This is apparent in the qualification data for secondary teachers quoted above.

207 These recruitment processes demonstrate both the difficulties and the limitations of recruiting the best possible teachers; some are self inflicted by the nature of the system, and some reflect the difficult position of education in the labour market.

Professional development

208 It is probably fair to characterise training and other professional development

opportunities in Kwara's education system as occasional and certainly not as part of a sector wide training strategy. Individual bodies and units put training into their budgets but with limited hope of being successful. Externally funded training sometimes brings opportunities but this is often for individuals rather than for strengthening units or departments as a whole. This is acknowledged in the ESSP which - for teachers - - it is argued should result in a teacher development strategy. The same case can be made for other cadres in the service who will need new skills and competencies if ESSP is to be implemented.

209 For teachers, the advent of the allocation of Federation funds channelled through to SUBEB (and matched by the State) means that SUBEB in its 2006 estimates to set aside N45 million for pre-primary training and advocacy programmes, N101 million for capacity building activities in the primary sector (but also covering survey and research activity), and N59.17 million for junior secondary schools (on school management, curriculum modules and HIV/AIDS). It was not possible to ascertain the details of the training programme nor its coverage but it seems to be an advance on previous activities.

210 LGEAs on the other hand have little or no money to organise formal training activities (although this does not mean, nor should it) that they cannot organise school based activities for very little cost (see SESP project options below).

211 There are a few opportunities for paid or unpaid leave for some teachers to upgrade their qualifications and in particular to acquire NCE but these chances seem to be dwindling. Over six years TSC has enabled 475 teachers and other personnel to take study leave with pay; a small number relative to the size of the teaching force. However, some enterprising teachers and other staff do find their own time to study but this is personally costly and time consuming.

212 For secondary teachers, opportunities are limited. Monthly expenditure returns from MOEST show occasional reference to a training activity but departments in MOEST said that they had little or no funds to run programmes even where their mandate sees this as one of their responsibilities. In some instances the TSC may mount courses on request from institutions of higher education.

213 Non-teaching staff also miss out. More than one department in MOEST said that members of their staff had had no training opportunities for 10 years or more. Where there are workshops these may or may not relate to the particular need of individuals or their departments. The inclusion of training in work plans or performance appraisals where these exist becomes as unreal as "as unreal" budgets.

214 There is also no real capacity in any of the organisations to look at how staff development can take place in house using the expertise and experience of colleagues. While the exchange of ideas may happen in a very informal way there seems no strong culture of collegiate learning and there is very little incentive in terms of possible advancement to stimulate this approach.

Promotion and Transfer

215 With little prospect of regular salary increases, promotion is, in theory, one way of gaining some advancement.

216 But for many in the system these opportunities are limited. SUBEB handles the promotion of primary teachers on the advice of LGEAS and following interviews at SUBEB headquarters. Anecdotally, LGAs may want to limit promotions as it is a cost against the salary allocation.

217 The TSC has full responsibility for the promotion transfer and discipline of teachers. Secondary teachers qualify for the possibility of promotion by having appropriate qualifications and not having been promoted for a stipulated period of time... Promotion interviews are held before recommendation.

218 Opportunities for those in MOEST and the education parastatals appear to be limited too as is evidenced in part by the length of service which many people have in the same post at middle and lower levels in their organisations. There is no obvious evidence that there is a culture of good performance and advancement. Many people seemed resigned to this situation. Some said they had had no advancement on current pay scales for 10 years or more. ESSP will need a different culture if it is to be implemented effectively. Enabling people to benefit from good performance from translating plan into practice should be one important strategy for operationalising ESSP.

219 Little data was readily available of transfers which in certain circumstances is a means of re-energising staff and bringing a fresh view to receiving schools or other organisations. Of less value are transfers resulting from political interference and influence.

Motivation - Incentives and Good Discipline

220 Much is made of poor morale and low levels of motivation in KWA-SEEDS and evidence for this is found through talking with people who have worked in the system for many years. In many cases this is less a lack of motivation than a feeling of helplessness and resignation that the ways of working and the environment within which people work has been so low for so long that people understandably lose hope and doubt real change is possible. At the same time it is humbling to meet people who continue to meet people who battle against the odds because they believe so fundamentally in the value of education.

221 How within such an environment can people be motivated to raise their performance? Clearly better pay is important especially for teachers who may earn as little as low N6500 a month. There is little incentive to work well (or indeed full time) if there is insufficient money to meet the basic needs of oneself and one's family.

222 Better promotion prospects, training opportunities and even just simple acknowledgement of their worth all need to play a part. And ESSP needs to recognise this.

223 Some departments in MOEST, as noted elsewhere feel that their best option is autonomy outside of the Ministry.

224 But are there other ways? In education it is notoriously difficult to see real achievements and outcomes. But evidence from other countries in Africa seems to suggest that if more people are given responsibilities to effect change at local levels in

schools and district offices with authority to utilise modest but important budgets for which they are accountable, including to their local communities, people do work and act differently. Similarly if units or departments are challenged to realise goals and objectives and given some authority to map the route and implement the project this can galvanise people. While it is not quite as simple as this paragraph suggest the central thread of the argument is valid.

225 Again, ESSP can give a lead here. It plans to deliver wide range of goals and programmes that result in better performance at the level of schools and other education organisations. This cannot be implemented solely in a rigid and hierarchical way. It requires the involvement and development of people at all levels in the system through well defined professional development strategies not just through training but through rewards for good performance.

226 A more modest proposal is to initiate (or reintroduce) a much clearer sequence than currently seems to exist of well defined job descriptions, individual and organisational work plans with well founded objectives against which performance appraisals can conducted and rewarded as appropriate. This type of discipline - which can help to motivate people - is insufficiently evident in Kwara. There are exceptions (e.g. SUBEB). These should be used for wider good practice.

227 In addition, some work load analysis should be undertaken on the numbers of staff required in particular departments in MOEST as the Ministry becomes more of a policy, coordination and monitoring body and less of an agency of implementation requiring a different combination of skills.

228 At the same time there need remains to ensure that certain types of firm discipline are exercised. It is difficult, for example to get data on absenteeism from work and school. Given that it is a topic that comes up fairly regularly it must be assumed that it exists relatively frequently although the schools the assessment team visited seemed to have relatively good checks in place and at least some LGEAs retain records in this regard. Absenteeism would appear more of a rural phenomenon than urban.

229 In a system which has a low number of teaching contact hours (by international standards) the impact on the quality of learning of even fewer hours is highly significant. This cannot be allowed to happen. In schools this should be handled by head teachers and to the extent possible by local communities. .

230 This section of this report may seem overly critical. It is not intended to suggest that people who work for education in Kwara are in some way directly at fault. The assessment team met many people from schools to MOEST who want change and realise that there must be change if education is to improve. They also know that an increase in salaries will not bring change on its own. Neither will better working environments. Better advancement through the system is important but it too will not drive educational change.

231 A holistic approach to developing capacity and rewarding performance is required and should be an integral part of ESSP design and delivery.

Summary Findings.

While there are shortages in some disciplines and skills, the main challenge in Kwara is to use deploy and use existing personnel much more effectively.

This requires a combination of recruitment policies that deploy people where they are most needed, recognising the disparities in the provision of education services that exist across the State; well-co-ordinated, professional development strategies that raise individual and organisational performance linked to the achievement of real education outcomes; management practices that enable people in and close to schools to take much greater responsibility for their own educational activities; salary levels that are commensurate with the roles and responsibilities expected of teachers and others in the education service; and incentives that openly reward good performance. The proposed reviews of these topics in ESSP in 2007 will be important first steps in these regards.

F THE USE OF TECHNOLOGY

232 In the terms of reference for this report, technology is interpreted very broadly to cover data, EMIS, staffing, equipment, vehicles and training and it is asked that these topics should be interpreted in the context of ESSP and SESP. In addressing this task the assessment team was aware of separate work being undertaken by Jim Shoobridge (CUBE EMIS Adviser) on management information systems in Kano, Kwara and Kaduna States and the team had access to the draft report of this work in Kaduna. In addition the back ground study of infrastructure was available

233 The team has framed this part of its report under four headings

- .Technology within schools
- Technology to enhance school improvement
- Maximising better the use of data for better education
- Technologies for making organisations function more effectively

Technology within schools²⁷

234 The team saw no evidence of computers in schools but learned that some secondary schools do use them. Of far more concern was the technology which is or is not available in primary schools. Blackboards and blackboard paint, chalk, exercise books, pencils, textbooks, somewhere to sit, a sanitary toilet, a place to play; these are the technologies that the schools of Kwara need most. At the very minimum each school should be entitled to a basic pack of basic learning technologies each and every term. And the needs of teachers should be met within this entitlement. There is considerable experience of minimum learning packages - especially within UNICEF - and these should be tapped.

235 The ESSP has plans to develop a Minimum Quality Standards (MQS) framework

²⁷ Reference has been made elsewhere in this report to the appalling state of school infrastructure not least for health and safety reasons. The need for investment in this area is taken as a given. The recommendations in the infrastructure report seem a wise way of proceeding.

in respect of infrastructure, facilities, provision of textbooks and learning materials. This should be costed and conducted expeditiously.

Technology to enhance school improvement

236 In addition to the basics referred to above, schools and the LGEAs and zonal officers that support them should ensure that some other minimum requirements are met. This includes basic security provision in schools. A copier or duplicator is important accepting the problems associated with Nigeria's electricity supply, Zonal officers and rural LGEAs need motor bikes if schools are to be visited and funds are needed for fuel and maintenance. Loan schemes for bike purchase can (and do) help here. The tragedy is that many of these and other items are seen as unobtainable extras.

Making better use of data

237 The assessment team was struck by the ready availability of data in Kwara, invariably shared freely for this report. Most of this material is generated manually and compiled on standard forms. There is clearly long experience of completing the same form year on year. And the typewriter still reigns over the PC.

238 Data is collected in schools, in LGEAS and in every other management body all of which have statisticians - at least in name - and planners. By virtue of both the vertical and horizontal lines of accountability and the linkages that exist between organisations, information is both shared and used for higher level use. And this is an important characteristic of information flows; it is a primarily one way movement from schools and local organisations upwards to MOEST. There is relatively little flow the other way, so that schools can experience direct benefits from the information they provide in terms of teachers, training, better infrastructure and adequate learning materials.

239 Some organisations are now using computers. Word processing takes place in some offices, bodies such as SUBEB and the Planning Directorate in MOEST are starting to collate and analyse school and financial data and there is an appetite to do this more thoroughly and systematically. Indeed it is difficult to see how ESSP can be advanced without a strong management information system. As noted in the situational analysis there are major discrepancies in State level data which presumably result from inadequacies in data collection and analysis at other levels in the system.

240 In Shoobridge's study of Kaduna.²⁸ it is argued convincingly that if a sector wide approach is to be really worked through in a State, this requires a strong collective effort across a broad spectrum of stakeholders - at different levels within the system, public and private, with civil societies and communities at large. For this to work effectively *establishing accountable information systems such as financial, personnel and education management information systems (EMIS) are critical to the implementation of a sector wide programme. In the absence of accountable information systems, the monitoring of progress towards the policy targets will be difficult, if not impossible. Accountable information systems are also required to track budget support, procurements and other inputs. To this end information technology is a critical part of the ESP [in Kaduna] strategies.*

²⁸ The team did not have access to the Kwara and Kano studies at the time of the mission.

241 The Shoobridge study goes on to argue for an initial focus on the ministry of education in the first phase of any support programme, followed by a two to three horizon for LGEAs and zonal officers with a school based information system being rolled out thereafter. This appears logical to this team as long as the process is understood and explained at all levels in the implementation of the programme.

242 The report sets out 15 time bound objectives and activities from 2006 to 2009. It is assumed that much the same line of argument will be advanced in the report for Kwara.

243 The draft Kwara ESSP already makes the case for developing a Financial Information System including public expenditure tracking to be operational by 2008. It refers to basic mapping studies on access, enrolment, attendance and retention but does not appear to link that to management information systems. Other systems wide proposals will almost certainly require EMIS capacity.

244 Clearly there are training and wider capacity building implications for the introduction of information systems and the Shoobridge State studies set out the implications of this in some detail. It is certainly the view of this team that this is an essential prerequisite for enabling system wide change in Kwara.

245 In translating these State level strategies into practice, it would be sensible to ensure that there is a high degree of compatibility with Federal work in this area, thereby enabling policy at the national level and across States to benefit. Although unclear as to the details, the assessment team understands that national level work on EMIS and on the development of financial budget and accounting packages under the Federal Accounts and Audit Committee (FAAC) across government have important implications for State level design work. The EMIS work is already having impact in Kwara's SUBEB.

246 At the same time there are other forms of information and communication that are equally important in advancing ESSP in Kwara. These are to do with advocacy and the continual need to ensure that the voice of education - its needs and imperatives and worth - are constantly communicated to the widest possible community. It is essential that the political constituency is informed right across government as political commitment is essential for long-term change. But it is equally important for information to be spread and debated to stimulate the demand for education and to push hard for its improvement. The media have a role to play here but for this to happen requires some creative work, particularly on the part of MOEST, to sell ESSP and ensure that it remains a part of public consciousness for as long as it is operational.

Technologies for making organisations function more effectively

247 Perhaps the most effective piece of technology at work in the education system in Kwara today is the mobile phone. Although it is used for a variety of purposes (and the economics of its use are not known to this assessment team) it clearly does have some efficiency benefits especially in contacting departments in different places and makes possible conversations across the State.

248 Far less effective is the use of transport (see also section C). This impacts most on those who need transport most - particularly those departments that are directly in touch with schools and especially those rural areas which are already disadvantaged

and where distance is a major constraint. The development of a transport policy within ESSP would be a sensible investment; waiting until a vehicle is no longer serviceable is not a good use of public resources.

249 The use of generators to overcome the deficiencies of Nigeria's electricity supply needs to be looked at carefully to ensure that those departments which need electricity on a regular or continuous basis (especially planning departments) have the necessary back up supplies.

Summary Findings

If technology is defined in its broadest sense then the most urgent need in Kwara is to ensure that primary classrooms and schools have their minimum basic needs met in terms of infrastructure, furniture, toilets and essential learning materials. This is rightly being proposed in ESSP.

Financial and educational management information systems are a necessary component and pre-requisite for the development and the implementation of ESSP.

ESSP needs its own communication strategy to ensure that it is understood and supported and as an important component of generating enhanced demand for education.

G CHANGE MANAGEMENT

250 The previous sections have summarised the organisational, financial, human resource and technological characteristics of the education sector in Kwara with a strong focus on what is needed in order to achieve UBE. The central thread of the argument has been that a renewed focus on improving schools is required and that this has implications for the ways in which the sector is organised and managed. Some of these changes are within the control of MOEST and other education organisations; but others are not - including levels of investment in education. They require wider institutional changes at Federal and State levels. This in turn needs sustained political commitment to education.

251 This section builds on the preceding analysis. It argues that the ESSP itself should be the primary vehicle for driving forward change. By the very process of taking ESSP forward, organisational and institutional challenges will arise and will need to be addressed. There is evidence of this happening already.

252 **First**, the development of the sector plan (and other sector planning exercises in recent years) has created a climate of engagement around educational issues across MOEST and its parastatals and with some other State ministries, largely but not exclusively through the efforts of the Plan's PPT. This has been a positive process and there is a clear sense of achievement among those centrally involved. This momentum needs to be sustained and involvement widened across the sector and beyond. An educational crusade is needed, firmly implanted within wider development efforts including KWA-SEEDS.

253 Admittedly, these processes place considerable pressure on people working for

education in Kwara even when external facilitation and advice is able to drive the work forward at a pace that might not have been possible with local resources alone. But the momentum is there.

254 **Second**, the process thus far has inevitably raised important questions around capacity building. A common response from nearly every organisation and department is that the key to making things work much better in the system and certainly a pre-requisite for implementing the ESSP is capacity building. But people use this term in a variety of different ways. Often the assumption is that new skills are needed and this is often expressed in terms of particular individual training needs.

255 At the same time discussion with those working for education suggests it is not necessarily lack of knowledge, but the inability to apply knowledge in environments - especially but not exclusively in schools - which seriously limit good educational and management practice. Some of these constraints are systemic - particularly the low level of responsibility given to those who actually deliver education.

256 **Third**, the draft ESSP gives impetus to moving in the direction of greater empowerment at local, school and community levels. Its emphasis on a comprehensive legal framework governing the rights and obligations of teachers, parents and students is a bold step in this direction. The push towards School Based Management, Whole School Development Planning and Capitation Grant Management also direct attention towards ways of working which represent a significant change in the culture of organising and managing schools. It is not an easy path to take. Accountability issues will need to be addressed but as this has happened in other places, there is no reason why they cannot be handled in Kwara although getting strong State and Federal backing will be important.

257 The very process of planning and implementing ESSP programmes is capacity building for those involved although clearly some elements may need very specific training, for example, in programme budgeting, using EMIS systems and in school level planning but a large part of what needs to happen is to gain commitment, reorient experience and learn from working together.

258 **Fourth**, and a related issue is the need to develop capacity within and across whole units and department. For example, while the assessment team learned of individuals from LGEAs attending training activities, in some cases in other countries, there was no evidence of the LGEA team benefiting from activities designed to raise the overall performance of their authority. Some of this can be handled by LGEAs coalescing as a total authority around school improvement plans and monitoring progress in relation to these plans (see below). This requires activity in all of the departments of the LGEA.

259 **Fifth**, ESSP recognises the need to develop operational plans for all sub-sectors in the system to ensure compliance with the ESSP and develop a climate of accountability. Work plans linked to outcome objectives and targets are also specified in the ESSP.

260 It is the case however that ESSP is basically framed with existing structures and existing organisations in mind. This is probably wise. Radical organisational change is unlikely in the short term for political reasons. Small adjustments are proposed for the

Planning and Personnel Department in MOEST but otherwise the status quo is maintained.

261 Nevertheless, it seems probable that the full implications of the ESSP for work load have not been assessed. As noted earlier in this report the workload implied by the draft ESOP is formidable. The studies that are being planned, the work practices that are to be introduced, the reallocation of scarce resources that may be required and the continuing negotiation with KWA-SEEDS are all activities that need to be managed.

262 Whether committees and working groups are the only way to proceed needs debate. It may be that a more dedicated task force is required to coordinate the work. This might be answerable to the Commissioner and work closely with the PPT. Such a task force would need a degree of authority to move activities forward with some speed. It needs to be multi-skilled including with staff from outside of MOEST and especially the Planning Commission.

263 The technical assistance team that it is planned should work in Ilorin should facilitate in any way that it can the processes by which the plan is advanced in the next few months including whenever possible making resources available for studies, training, consultation etc.

264 In this regard it has been decided what type of technical assistance is required in advance of the development of the sector plans; a financial management and planning advisor, a procurement advisor and a team leader with some policy development responsibilities. Detailed TORS have been drafted and the recruitment process is underway. It is to be hoped a) that there is good degree of flexibility in the roles that this pre-ordained team can and will play and b) that there is scope for obtaining different types of expertise depending on the outcomes of the costing and prioritisation of the ESSP in the next few months.

265 With regard to the wider institutional and environmental changes which would help drive change, the more important of these include:

- Measures to strengthen the demand for education through national and local political advocacy, the engagement of civil society and religious bodies, a willingness to provide incentives and support for the poorest households and to enable good private schools to expand and grow.
- A willingness to countenance some greater delegation of authority
- A re-assessment of levels of funding for basic education within the KWA-SEEDS budget ceilings and probably more importantly at the Federal level
- An overhaul of budgeting practice to ensure that budgets are being prepared for real resources
- A coherent teacher strategy - from recruitment to retirement - which lessens the fragmentation of responsibility for different aspects and different levels of teacher management and which rewards good teacher performance.
- Legislation - if it is needed - to empower schools and their communities

266 It is unlikely that these wider changes will come about easily. They have political connotations and education is in competition with other sectors for scarce resources. But the elaboration of a strong ESSP can play its part in influencing this wider institutional environment particularly through strong advocacy and sensitization around its goals, programmes and, in due course, its achievements.

Summary Findings

ESSP can contribute to organisational and institutional change modest though this may be in a complex yet rigid organisational structure in Kwara's education system. By the very process of its development, organisational and institutional issues will have to be confronted if the ambitious goals of ESSP are really to be drivers for change in the State.

The full management and operational implications of making ESSP work have yet to be addressed. In the short term this may need a dedicated task force to make things happen relatively quickly. The task force will need clear authority and lines of accountability

The SESP project and the technical assistance which is already being recruited should be both flexible and proactive in the next few months in helping to sustain ESSP momentum and get year one activities underway without delay. If this requires some seed money and or specialist advice - national or international - this should be forthcoming.

H THE STATE EDUCATION SECTOR PROJECT (SESP)

267 The promise of SESP has helped to galvanise and facilitate State sector planning. There are high expectations of what the State project can deliver including in some quarters through filling the financing gap for the overall sector plan.

268 Although this is unrealistic in the short term, current Federal level discussions with the IMF following the African Finance Minister's meeting Abuja in 2006, the new facility that is provided by the Fast Track Initiative and the possibility of engaging new donors in the future may allow for budget support as an option in the future.

269 But over the next two to three years it is likely that the States with SESP will need to design one or more strategic interventions which:

- Have demonstrable impact on access to quality basic education within two years
- Are totally consistent with school improvement strategies under ESSP
- Contribute to change management across the education system
- Are developed within the structures of the education system
- Utilise low cost but cost effective strategies

Some Proposals

270 What follows focuses entirely on UBE. ESSP is rightly a sector wide programme and should certainly be implemented as such. But the needs are greatest in basic education.

271 A very strong case can be made for what might be described as emergency measures to support basic education in Kwara. Such is the state of most schools, short-term investment in infrastructure and learning materials can be justified without much difficulty. The degree to which significant investments can be managed quickly and transparently while leaving sustainable good practice in infrastructure development

and/or textbook procurement is left to the judgement of separate studies.

272 In addition, the case for the systematic introduction of management information systems is a necessary underpinning for a sector wide programme. Given that this is elaborated elsewhere no further detail is provided here. A strong teacher development programme is also required - again the subject of other studies.

273 The thrust of this report has been to recognise and argue for a holistic view of school improvement and the implications that this has for a) lessening fragmentation of effort and b) bringing resources, support and advice much closer to schools. This is the path that is being charted by the ESSP. The list of options is potentially a long one but a small set of propositions are outlined here and elaborated in **Annex 17**. They are outlined as separate activities but could be conceived - and possibly managed - as a whole.

A School Improvement Project In a system characterised by neglect how can schools be energised? A simple answer is to let the ESSP take its course given the emphasis that it places on whole school development but SESP should add value and a specific school improvement project is one possibility. The temptation is to suggest a pilot or demonstration project. But the arguments against this are that the history of similar projects is not compelling and that the influence or impact on wider State practice is likely to be slow. What is needed is a demonstration of improved practice right across the State consistent with the proposals in ESSP.

One way forward is to develop a LGEA school improvement programme which has a double objective: a) to strengthen and energise LGEAs (in close partnership with other bodies, departments and local communities) to improve the quality of schooling and b) to demonstrate school improvement in a substantial proportion of schools in all 16 LGEAs - perhaps a third of schools (500) in the first two years of the project.

This will require (provisionally):

- A core planning and development team that might be based in SUBEB (with technical assistance as appropriate)
- Agreement on school improvement targets that should be achieved by the end of 2008 in an agreed number of schools
- Identification of the ways in which LGEAs will contribute to the achievement of the school improvement targets
- Agreement on low resource input measures that can make a difference to schooling
- Determination - with technical assistance - of the capacity building implications for the 16 LGEAs over the lifetime of the programme and the development of a tailor made programme accordingly
- Agreement on the levels of funding and logistical support that will be required to a) facilitate LGEA based capacity building and b) manage school improvement work.
- Define the involvement of key agencies (MOEST, SUBEB, Local Government, PTA, NUT etc).
- Determine a monitoring strategy.

The rationale for a project of this sort is to demonstrate that it is possible to make improvements in primary schools through partnerships within schools and with better support services. This is consistent and can be a part of ESSP's efforts to introduce whole school management, school management committees and capitation grants.

A Quality Assessment Programme No one questions that the quality of education in most of Kwara's schools is low. Exactly how low and whether there are major disparities across

schools and within schools is not known. With the demise of the Common Entrance Examination there will be even less knowledge about levels of literacy and numeracy. But this information is needed and needed regularly if improvement measures are to be well designed and meaningful. At the same time continuous assessment and testing skills are weak (and difficult in very large classes) and the capacity within MOEST is also limited.

It is proposed that there should be:

- Agreement on a schedule for the assessment (at a minimum) of reading and numeracy skills in Grades 3 and 6 in the last term of the 2006/2007 school year and thereafter every year (or every two years).
- Determination of the process by which tests will be designed and administered that is consistent with wider State and Federal practice and programmes,
- Agreement on which body/department (MOEST Inspectorate; SUBEB: Assessment Unit - School Services) should develop and manage the programme.
- Identification of the capacity strengthening needs to implement the programme with a clear remit to develop a long term assessment capacity. In this regard consideration should be given to seeking the advice of IIEP UNESCO and to learn from the experience of the African SACMEQ programme.
- Define and implement a capacity strengthening programme (with technical assistance as appropriate)
- Conduct tests in an agreed sample of schools
- Prepare issue and publicize a high quality report on quality in Kwara schools highlighting the key policy and practice implications

This project is consistent with that part of the ESSP that proposes measures (under Objective 1) to improve the quality of basic education and establish a comprehensive set of minimum quality standards and to review the assessment system

A School Networking Programme. There are many different ways to improve schools. Self help in partnership with other local schools is one option. It provides opportunities to share problems and solutions. The intensity of activity can be determined locally. Activities can be subject specific or focused on particular issues (e.g. managing multi-shift or multigrade classes; working with the community) It can empower head teachers and teachers but requires advice and input from inspectors. In some African countries activities of this type focus on resource centres but this may be an investment too far at this stage in Kwara. But resource packs or book boxes for schools and teachers can be put together to kick start the process. A small fund to facilitate the programme should also be provided. The locus for defining this programme would need to be agreed: perhaps in a strengthened Schools Services Department or the Inspectorate or through a combination of the two.

In this instance, there probably is a case for arguing for a trialling of the process but it should be trialling that takes place in each LGEA - perhaps two groups of neighbouring schools in each LGEA.

It is proposed that there should be:

- Agreement on a three year school networking programme -KWA-NET?
- Determination of the location for programme development and guidance (Inspectorate/ School Services/ SUBEB)
- Opportunities for key staff to learn from experience elsewhere in Africa
- Selection of pilot school groups in each LGEA through consultation
- Agreement of action frameworks with head teachers from every school
- Development of school resource packs and other resource materials
- Provision of a modest school networking fund; agreement on who is accountable for the use of funds and for audit and reporting

- A simple monitoring framework to assess impact on school improvement
- A communication /information strategy on the work of school networks
- Small awards annually for good practice

This proposal is also consistent with ESSP quality education proposals.

274 All three proposals should be grounded in existing structures and departments. They are likely to require technical assistance inputs but not necessarily on a full time basis with the possible exception of the LGEA school improvement work. **Annex 17** provides more detail but the detail should really be determined by and within Kwara State.

Summary Findings

Budget support is not a short term option. There is a strong case for interventions in infrastructure, textbooks, management information systems and a medium-term teacher development strategy.

There is an urgent need to develop ways of improving what is happening in primary schools quickly with strong support from those bodies that are closest to them. This is consistent with this reports suggested criteria for SESP supported projects and programmes:

- **Real impact on access to quality basic education within two years**
- **Total consistency with school improvement strategies under ESSP**
- **A contribution to change management across the education system**
- **Development within the structures of the education system**
- **Utilise low cost but cost effective strategies**

Three school improvement projects are proposed.

- 1 A state wide programme of school improvement for 500 schools (one third of the public primary schools in the State) in each of the 16 LGEAs, allied to a programme of LGEA development and capacity building.**
- 2 A quality assessment programme that introduces and then sustains regular testing for numeracy and reading in all of Kwara's primary schools, allied to building the capacity to develop the programme, implement it and use the findings to inform school improvement strategies.**
- 3 A school networking project to develop the capacities of schools to resolve some of their own individual problems through building links and undertaking joint activities within school clusters.**

CONCLUSION

275 In seeking to meet the terms of reference for this report a set of assumptions were described in the Introduction. It is worth restating that this report has unashamedly focused on basic education. It has done so because this is where the priority lies in ESSP and SESP. And it is self-evidently where the greatest problems lie, accepting, as does ESSP that other objectives across the sector are important if Kwara and Nigeria

are to develop the skilled human resources which the State and the country require and deserve.

276 Recently, Nigeria has been described as being at yet another of its political crossroads as the 2007 elections approach. With some justification Kwara State can be said to be at an educational crossroads. It cannot be business as usual in the education sector in 21st century. If the ambition and the opportunities initiated by ESSP are grasped in their entirety there is a real opportunity to bring about radical change and re-energise education and the education community. In the view of this assessment team this opportunity should not be missed.